

The Catholic and Episcopal Churches and the Education Act (Scotland) 1872

Stephen J. McKinney¹ and Roger Edwards²

University of Glasgow¹

Researcher and member of Scottish Episcopal Church historians' group²

ABSTRACT

The Education (Scotland) Act 1872 offered the different Christian denominational schools the opportunity to transfer their schools and become non-denominational Board schools. This option was rejected by the Catholic and Episcopal churches. There were serious anxieties about issues such as the loss of denominational status and the proposal that religious instruction and observance was confined to the beginning and/or end of the school day to facilitate the conscience clause. Retaining the schools was a courageous move especially as there were very serious financial implications in the continued support for school buildings, resources and teacher salaries. There were many serious challenges for the teachers, pupils, parents and congregations (providing funds for the schools) that are addressed in the article. This article provides an examination of the Catholic and Episcopal schools in the lead up to the act, the reaction of the two churches to the Act and the consequences of the non-transfer of the schools.

KEYWORDS: Catholic schools; Episcopal Schools; Teachers; Teacher Training; Education (Scotland) Act, 1872.

INTRODUCTION

This article seeks to explore the impact and consequences of the Education Act (Scotland) 1872 for the Catholic and Episcopal schools in Scotland. Under the conditions of the 1872 Act, the Board (or public) school was to be open to children of all denominations. Parents did have the right to withdraw children from religious instruction and from religious observance, according to the conscience clause. Religious instruction and observance would be conducted according to use and wont at the beginning or the end of the school day or at both the beginning and the end of the day in the board school (Education Act, 1872 section 68). This would facilitate the exercise of the conscience clause as the withdrawal of pupils at these stages would avoid disruption to the school timetable (Knox, 1953).

The Catholic and Episcopal churches did not transfer their schools at the time of the Act because of serious anxieties about the preservation of the denominational status and the nature of the religious instruction and observance in the new Board schools. There were some differences between the Catholic and Episcopal schools in this era in terms of: system of schooling, the types of school, the sources of funding, the support of religious communities and the development of teacher training. Notwithstanding these differences, the arguments for the non-transferral of the schools were similar and they shared a struggle to fund and

maintain the schools and the teaching staff up till the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918.

Neither of these Christian denominations was homogeneous but had a diverse population and included migrant groups. The Catholic community was composed of many Irish immigrants, especially in the West of Scotland, but there were also Scottish Catholics from the North of Scotland and the Islands and, in the post 1872 era, there would be a steady influx of Italian Catholics (Colpi, 1993; Devine, 2006). The Episcopal Church was composed of Scots, Irish migrants and a constant flow of people from England (Meredith, 2017). The migrants from Ireland for both churches were often impoverished and the two churches provided pastoral care, social welfare and, crucially, school education.

The leaders and members of the two denominations remained conscious of the history and experience of the penal laws. Bishop Eden, the Bishop of Moray, Ross and Caithness and Primus (leader) of the Scottish Episcopal Church hierarchy delivered a 'state of the Church' sermon on the 14th August, 1881 (Eden, 1881). His Sermon acknowledged the progress made in the Episcopal Church since the repeal of the penal laws and decried any antagonism towards the Established Church of Scotland. Nevertheless, Bishop Eden was mindful of the history of persecution, exclusion, the subjection to penal statutes and the disestablished and dis-endowed status of the Episcopal Church. The Roman Catholic Church was in a different position as the hierarchy would not be restored until 1878, after the 1872 Act (Ross, 1978). This was a highly symbolic event about the status of the Catholic Church in Scotland and there are mixed academic views on the public reception of the restoration of the Catholic hierarchy. McRoberts (1978) argued that the restoration was greeted with civilised tolerance, with one or two exceptions, but Ross (1978) proposed a general level of public mistrust and fear about the increase in the numbers in the Catholic community in the middle of the nineteenth century.

The article is divided into five sections: The types of Catholic and Episcopal school; The reaction of the Episcopal and Catholic churches to the Education (Scotland) Act 1872; Implications of the Education (Scotland) Act 1872 for the non-transferred Catholic and Episcopal Schools; Religious orders and congregations and, the last section, teachers and teacher training. The article will be completed with some concluding remarks.

TYPES OF CATHOLIC AND EPISCOPAL SCHOOL

Some Catholic schools were established to attract the children of the more wealthy Catholics. The Ursulines of Jesus, for example, drew from upper class ladies for membership of their community and focused in the first instance on the school education of the 'young ladies of the upper and middle classes' (Kehoe, 2010: 76). The majority of the Catholic schools, especially in the West of Scotland and in places like Dundee, educated the poorer Catholic children. At the time of the 1872 Act, there were 65 Catholic schools in Scotland a figure which more than doubled by 1882 to 138 (Anderson, 1995). This dramatic increase in Catholic schools can be compared to the increase in the Episcopal schools from 58 in 1872 to 78 in 1882. This can also be compared to the very sharp fall in Church of Scotland schools from 1,306 in 1872 to 124 in 1882. The Free Church recorded a

fall from 550 schools in 1872 to 32 in 1882. These figures reflect the move from the main forms of Presbyterian denominational schooling to Board schools.

It was not always possible to provide a local Catholic school and there remained some anomalies: the Catholic population in a particular area was low (Skermorie) or was too spread out (Lochgelly and Cowdenbeath in Fife, Salisbury in Lanarkshire) or the poverty of the Catholic community forestalled any attempts to establish and support a Catholic school (South Uist, Barra). The children in these areas attended the local Board Schools and attended Sunday school for religious instruction (Treble 1978). The Board schools in South Uist would all have at least one Catholic teacher by the turn of the twentieth century.

There were some differences between the Episcopal schools and the Catholic schools. The Catholic schools were established to educate the Catholic children and the vast majority of children in Catholic schools were Catholic. The Episcopal schools were established to educate the Episcopal children from poor and wealthy backgrounds, and to re-establish links with lapsed families. In some places, however, the Episcopal school aimed to educate the poor children from non-Episcopalian families and, at times, the Episcopal Church was accused of attempting to convert the children (White, 1998). School education was perceived to be an important part of the mission of the revived Episcopal church that was energised by the repeal of the penal laws in 1792 and heavily influenced by the Oxford movement (Goldie, 1976). This mission to the poor was focussed on pastoral care and social welfare and the provision of schools and teachers for education. The individual Episcopal schools emerged whenever a clergyman had sufficient funds to found a school. The schools were almost exclusively primary (or elementary) schools as it was considered pointless to promote post elementary school education for the poor (White, 1998). There were a few exceptions and these included: Glenalmond, the High school in Aberdeen for girls and the Loretto School under the guidance of Hutchinson Almond. Meredith (2017) has established that the Episcopal Church was attentive to the incomers from the Highlands, England and especially Ireland who had arrived in Glasgow and Dundee. They were attracted by the employment prospects in the industrial areas. These Irish were often poor, 'low church,' and opposed to ritualism. They were also antipathetic towards Roman Catholics and arrived with strong links to the Orange Order – an uncomfortable connection for the nascent Anglo-Catholic Episcopal Church in Scotland.

The Episcopal schools included a few schools that were modelled on the English public schools. This included the austere and 'deadly cold' Glenalmond in Perthshire, originally founded as the combined Holy Trinity theological seminary and school for boys (Lochhead, 1966: 83). The school was opened in 1847 and catered mostly for the upper class. Loretto school, founded in 1827, was transformed into a public school with an Episcopal ethos under the headship of Hely Hutchinson Almond (1862-1903). St Mary's in Edinburgh 1878 was opened for the education of girls who belonged to the Scottish Episcopal Church and especially for the daughters of Episcopal clergy. The school was founded by the Society of the Reparation of St Mary and St John (Lochhead, 1996). The school was later transferred to Aberdeen.

The missions in the West of Scotland were directed at the nominal and lapsed members of the Episcopal Church – these were primarily the impoverished Irish migrants (Meredith, 2017). There were Episcopal schools that were initiated as part of a mission and the mission was later consolidated with a Church building or a chapel school. A good example is the success of the mission station and school in St Mary's Cowcaddens, Glasgow, which led to the erection of a building with the double purpose of school and chapel (The Scottish Witness, 1868). In the Diocese of Glasgow and Galloway, the number of schools increased to 18 by 1853, educating around 1,152 children every day. The Episcopal mission in Dumbarton provides some useful insights into the diverse uses of the mission school and, at the same time, the socio-economic situation of some of the Irish migrants. This mission ministered to the families of Irish workers and built a school room in 1864 and by 1865, the school had an attendance of 160 children (Meredith, 2017). The school room was a multi-purpose room that was used for classes during the day, religious services for the poor (those who did not have decent clothing for attendance at Church) and for meetings of the Orange Lodge in the evening.

There is an interesting and unusual parallel to be drawn between the schools attached to St Andrew's Catholic Cathedral in Dundee and St Columba's Episcopal Church by the Castle, Edinburgh. Both churches were built on hills and there were rooms below the churches that were used for schools. St Andrew's Cathedral in Dundee was opened as a church in 1836 (dedicated as a Cathedral in 1923). There were two halls below the church that were used as school rooms (King, 1978). This was one of the first Catholic schools in Dundee in the Post-Reformation era. St Columba's by the Castle had a mission for the poor, which included a day school for poor children that provided meals for the 'more regular and necessitous' children (Harding, 2007). The school was closed in the 1881 and the schoolroom was used as a Church Hall.

THE REACTION OF THE EPISCOPAL AND CATHOLIC CHURCHES TO THE EDUCATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 1872

The Catholic Bishops were anxious about a number of issues highlighted by the introduction of the 1872 Act. They were concerned that the arrangements for religious instruction and religious observance in the Board schools had the potential to be instruments to advance 'the interests of the Church of Scotland' or even to promote a secularism that would dominate National education in Scotland (Treble, 1978). The conscience clause was rejected by the Catholic clergy who also objected to the idea of the separation of *secular* and *religious* instruction within the school day. They supported the idea that religion should 'infuse every branch of education' in the Catholic school (Anderson, 1995: 56). Some of the leading members of the Catholic Church argued that the Catholic schools should be supported by the state – an argument that would continue to be articulated up to the Education (Scotland) Act 1918 (Fitzpatrick, 2000; McKinney, 2020a). There was also opposition to the lack of compensation for transferred schools which had been mostly built and funded by the Catholic community. The decision, then, was to reject the opportunity to transfer the Catholic schools in Scotland and they were retained under the control of the Catholic Church.

In the lead up to the 1872 Act, Hugh Scott of Gala, an Episcopal layman, wrote a series of pamphlets focused on *The Schools of the Episcopal Church* (Meredith, 2017). He warns of the dangers of losing the denominational status of the Episcopalian schools (Scott, 1870a):

We must present, then, an united front upon this matter to Parliament and to the country; and whilst anxious to throw no obstacles in the way of a measure for the education of the people, we are not in any way prepared to sacrifice our schools, which must necessarily ever be the mainstay of the Church of Christ.

He called for solidarity within the Episcopal Church and greater involvement of the laity in the move to preserve the Episcopal schools (Scott, 1870b). Scott was equally anxious that the Episcopal Training Institution was maintained (Scott, 1870b). In 1871 he alerted the Episcopal Church that they must prepare to continue to support the schools using their own resources (Scott, 1871). He argued that the Episcopal Church must retain its own schools and resist being subsumed into an emerging national system which would essentially be operated for Presbyterian interests (Scott, 1872). Scott considered that the best settlement that could be achieved by the transfer of the Episcopal schools would have been to use the conscience clause to excuse the children from Presbyterian religious instruction and observance.

A few years later, there were a number of strong reactions reported by prominent members of the Episcopal Church concerning the implications of the 1872 Act and the continuation of the Episcopal schools. These reactions were articulated at the Episcopal Church Congress in Edinburgh in 1874. The leaders of the two prestigious and influential Episcopal educational institutions contributed their views on the importance of the continuation of the Episcopalian schools (Edinburgh Evening News, 1874). The Rev G.P. Robinson, the Warden of Trinity College, Glenalmond, warned that the obligation to contribute to the Board schools and, at the same time, contribute to the Church schools might deter people from using the Church schools. He suggested an increase in the contribution from the Church Society. The Rev C. Smith, principal of the Episcopal Teacher Training College, believed that the schools were the key to the continuity in the Church and would bring the poor back to the Church. Other responses included those of the Rev Robinson and the Rev Julius Wood from Greenock. They were anxious about the ambiguous nature of the provision for religious instruction and observance in the Act and warned that the Episcopal schools were required to ensure that the children received a religious and moral education.

IMPLICATIONS OF THE EDUCATION (SCOTLAND) ACT 1872 FOR THE NON-TRANSFERRED CATHOLIC AND EPISCOPAL SCHOOLS

The public or Board schools that were introduced as a result of the 1872 Act were funded by 'joint contributions from the Exchequer and the local educational rates' (Treble, 1978). There would be no assistance from the rates for the Catholic and Episcopal schools that were not transferred and remained

independent of the Board school system (Fitzpatrick, 2000). Further, the Catholic and Episcopal families that financially supported the non-transferred schools received no exemption from the rates – they were effectively paying for schooling twice. There were some small government grants available for the Catholic and Episcopal schools (and other voluntary schools), but they still needed to seek other sources of funding to sustain the schools and were normally only able to charge small fees because the majority of the children were from poor families (Scotland, 1969a).

Board schools were controlled by the local Boards. Catholic schools were run by managers, usually the local parish priest, appointed by the Bishop (Treble, 1980). The Diocesan Education Board had the task of providing teachers, whether certificated, or pupil-teachers, for the Catholic schools (Treble, 1978). Despite the marked differences between the Board schools and the separate Catholic schools, the Catholic community sought elected representation on the local school Boards, commonly a local Catholic priest. The Catholics, as taxpayers, were concerned about the spending of tax money in the local communities and also sought positions on the attendance committees as there were strict sanctions for persistently absent children in any school, Board schools or otherwise (Vaughan, 2012).

A number of Catholic academics propose that the history of Catholic education after the 1872 Act is a history of the struggle for survival of the Catholic schools (Kenneth, 1968; Fitzpatrick, 1986; McDermid, 1996). The fund-raising efforts of local communities were essential for maintaining the Catholic schools. The access to government grants was dependent on the efficiency of the school but this was a challenge given the poor physical condition of many Catholic schools (Kenneth, 1968). Treble (1978) points out that the teachers in Catholic schools were often working in overcrowded classrooms that were ill equipped and located in inadequate buildings. Skinnider (1967) presents a picture of the Catholic schools in Glasgow trying to maintain standards but struggling with inadequate funding and continued absenteeism as a result of poverty. The contrast between the buildings of the Catholic schools and the Board schools became more marked in the later stages of the 19th century.

A large number of new Board schools had to be built in Glasgow immediately after the 1872 Act to accommodate the children who had not been enrolled in school prior to the Act. In 1873 the overall roll in the existing 228 schools was 52,644, yet the number of children in the city aged five to thirteen was 87,294. The School Board of Glasgow opened 'twenty-seven large new schools' between 1874 and 1879 to accommodate the increased numbers (Hamilton, 2011: 117). The Newly built Board schools in Glasgow were well apportioned with spacious classrooms that were properly ventilated, halls for drill and rooms for technical subjects. Govan Parish School Board was the first Board to introduce school swimming pools. The class teacher in the Catholic school, by contrast, endured long hours, often taught large classes of pupils, had to cope with noise and smell and issues with the heating, light and ventilation and had responsibility for a larger number of pupil teachers (Stewart, 1995).

There were recurring issues of poor attendance in Catholic schools. Many Catholic families were impoverished or living on low incomes derived from

unskilled or semi-skilled work (Treble, 1978). They needed to supplement the family income by sending the children to work and often withdrew the children from schooling at an early age or supported irregular attendance. One practice was the employment of children as 'half-timers' (McDermid, 1996). The half-timers attended school every second day and worked the other days in the mills or attended school in the morning and worked in the afternoon. While this was very uncommon in most parts of Scotland including the major city of Glasgow, it was particularly prevalent in Dundee where the number of 'half-timers', mostly working-class girls, was high. This was because the jute mills were heavily dependent on female and child labour. There was also a high percentage of 'half-timers' in places like Paisley and other parts of Renfrewshire.

The Episcopal schools were funded by a combination of Government grants, local contributions and fees paid by pupils' families but also by grants from the Scottish Episcopal Church Society. The Church Society was established by the Episcopal Church General Synod of 1838 and one of its functions was to 'to provide Episcopalian schoolmasters, books, and tracts for the poor' (Goldie, 1976: 85). The expectation was that every congregation would donate an annual collection to provide funds for the Society. Strong (2002) records that the school masters of the Episcopal schools in North and South Ballachulish in the mid nineteenth century both received £150 per annum from the Church Society to supplement the fees collected from the families of the pupils.

The anxieties expressed by the Rev G.P. Robinson and others about the expected decrease in voluntary contributions after the 1872 Act were initially alleviated by the news that voluntary contributions had increased by nearly £300 in 1876 (*The Scotsman*, 1877). Despite this increase, funding for the Episcopal schools was to prove problematic and in 1882, the overall expenditure of the schools was £9,938 exceeding the income of £9,263 (*The Scotsman*, 1882). The Church Society would be replaced by another body, the Episcopal Church Representative Council, in 1878 which took charge of the management of the finances of the Church, including any money allocated for education (*Edinburgh Evening News*, 1876).

Many of those who promoted Episcopal schools demonstrated a dogged determination to ensure their continued existence. Canon Gregory argued persuasively at the Episcopal Church Conference in Edinburgh in 1881 that the future well-being of the Church depended to a large extent on rigorous religious education in elementary schools. It was reported in *The Scotsman* (1881) that:

...he fearlessly said that no sacrifices could be too great for the Church to make in order to secure and perfect a really hearty system of religious education.

The actions of the Rev. Clement Leigh Caldwell, of the Holy Trinity Episcopal Church in Stirling, in 1882 provides a good practical example. The premises of Holy Trinity school were more or less condemned and faced substantial loss of grant money. Rev. Caldwell understood his school as an 'outpost for carrying on the Holy War against sin and ignorance' and did not transfer the school to the local Board but rebuilt it, despite still trying to clear the debt on

the Church itself. (Holy Trinity Church, 2021). The new school was completed in 1884.

RELIGIOUS ORDERS AND CONGREGATIONS

The Catholic female and male religious orders and congregations of the Catholic Church had a significant and lasting impact on Catholic schools before, during and after the 1872 Act. Their activities are fairly well documented in terms of archival material and academic literature (Sadler's Catholic Directory, 1891; Handley, 1950, 1958; Dilworth, 1978; Fitzpatrick, 1995, 1998; O'Hagan, 2006; Kehoe, 2010; McKinney, 2020b). The religious communities in the Episcopal Church in Scotland were on a smaller scale and are less well documented (or documents are less accessible) (Lochhead, 1966; Bertie, 2000; Luscombe, 2014). According to the evidence available, all of the Episcopal religious communities that taught in schools were female and often operated with more limited resources and personnel than the Catholic religious communities.

The first Catholic religious women and men to arrive in Scotland in the nineteenth century were responding to urgent requests from the clergy for help with elementary Catholic school education and to care for the sick and the poor (Dilworth 1978). By 1872, The Catholic religious communities that engaged in school education in Scotland had their origins in Ireland, Belgium and England and France. They included the Ursulines of Jesus (arrived in Scotland 1834), The Franciscans (1847), The Sisters of Mercy (1849), The Marist Brothers (1858) and the Jesuits (1859). Many of the female and male religious teaching congregations and orders in the mid to late nineteenth century originated in France (Handley, 1950). These religious women and men were profoundly influenced by the new 'flexibility to ideas of charity and missionary zeal' and the pedagogical principles of John Baptist de La Salle (Handley, 1950: 23). Handley argues that these religious brought vocational commitment and dedication to the teaching profession, pedagogical expertise drawn from French methods and a deep understanding and adherence to the philosophy of Christian education of the Catholic church. They addressed the challenges of educating the children of the largely impoverished Catholic community in Scotland with missionary zeal combined with strict discipline, formal Catholic practice and devotions and a strong emphasis on punctuality and regular attendance.

The teaching religious lived in communities where ideas and problems could be shared and discussed, and the salaries could be vired into the funds of the community to keep costs low in the maintenance of their schools (Stewart, 1995). This commitment to school education would continue through the twentieth century and only began to diminish as the numbers of religious in the communities began to dwindle. While they were clearly able to draw on the intellectual, pedagogical and spiritual resources of their religious community, they were also able to draw on a supply of human resource to replenish and refresh their numbers. This was exemplified in the case of the Notre Dame Sisters and the continual renewal of the staffing of the sisters for the Teacher Training College in Glasgow (Fitzpatrick, 1995).

The religious orders and congregations provided high quality approaches to learning and teaching and the government inspectors were normally very

satisfied with the schools that were run by the religious (Treble, 1978; Stewart, 1995). The religious contributed models of high-quality Catholic schooling, arguably helping to ensure the continued viability of Catholic schools in this period of time. The female religious, in particular, made a significant contribution to the education of girls at both the elementary and post-elementary stages and also in night schools (Aspinwall, 1982) They were almost completely responsible for the secondary education of girls in 1872 and the immediate post 1872 era (Dilworth, 1978).

The focus of the work of the religious communities in the Episcopal Church was more on pastoral and social welfare and the mission to the poor, rather than school education. This reflected the evangelical vision of the Church in the mid to late nineteenth century. Where religious communities in the Episcopal Church were engaged in school education, it was generally small scale and sometimes quite short lived. The Community of St. Andrew of Scotland opened a small school in Niddry Street, Edinburgh in the 1860s for fifty children (Luscombe, 2014). In Kirkwall, the Community of St. Margaret of Scotland worked in the school between 1892 and 1905 (Bertie, 2000). The Society of All Saints ran a school for three hundred pupils in the parish of All Saints in Edinburgh in the late nineteenth century (Luscombe, 2014). The Community of St Mary and St John in Aberdeen ran a primary school for local children and a school for Higher Education (transferred from its original setting in Edinburgh) for the daughters of the Episcopal clergy in the late nineteenth century.

An inventory of the schools in Dundee in 1886 provides a fascinating account of the Catholic and Episcopal schools and is also illustrative of the resilience of the remaining private schools and other denominational schools. According to the Dundee Directory of 1886, there were: fourteen Board schools; six Catholic schools; four Episcopalian schools; nine private schools; three Free Church schools and two Church of Scotland Schools in Dundee (The Dundee Directory, 1885-1886). The interesting point here is that the Catholic religious communities had responsibility for nearly all of the six Catholic schools, whereas there is no indication of any involvement of Episcopal religious communities in the four Episcopal schools in Dundee. The Marist brothers had responsibility for St Andrew's and St Stephen's boys' schools and for the boys in St Mary's school. The Sisters of Mercy had responsibility for St Andrew's and St Joseph's girls' school. St Mary's Lochee was the only Catholic school that was not managed by a religious community. The four Episcopal schools probably reflected the increased demand for Episcopal schooling created by the influx of Irish migrants (Strong, 2002). It is also worth noting that there were three Free Church Schools and two Church of Scotland schools remaining in the city at this time. By the time of the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918, there was only a handful of Free Church and Church of Scotland Schools remaining in the whole country.

TEACHERS AND TEACHER TRAINING

The Education (Scotland) Act, 1872 made school compulsory for all children aged five to thirteen. This applied to the public schools but also to the remaining voluntary schools, which included the Catholic and Episcopal schools. This created further serious challenges for the Catholic system, especially in areas

that had a large Catholic population, for example, Glasgow and other parts of the West of Scotland (O'Hagan and Davis, 2007). The introduction of compulsory schooling created a major demand for the recruitment of new teachers (Bischof, 2015). The recruitment of qualified teachers for Catholic schools had been highly problematic before the 1872 Act and, as has been stated, the Catholic schools relied heavily on pupil-teachers (Cruikshank, 1970; Treble, 1978). Treble reports that in 1886, 71.1% of the female certificated staff and 75.6% of the male certificated staff in Board schools had been trained in a training College compared to 31.5% female and 61.5% male certificated teachers in Catholic schools (Treble, 1978).

The extensive use of the pupil-teachers in the Catholic elementary schools helped to resolve some of the pressing staffing issues in schools in the post 1872 era (Treble, 1978; Anderson, 1997). The pupil-teachers helped the class teacher cope with the large class sizes in the Catholic schools and provided much needed assistance (Wilson, 1967; Anderson, 1995). They were paid considerably less than certificated teachers and this provided some financial relief to cost-conscious school managers. However, the ratio of teacher to pupil was often higher in the Catholic schools than in the Board schools. Further, the training of the pupil-teacher was limited and could not be compared to a College education (Scotland, 1969b). This applied equally to the certificated teachers who had been successful through the pupil-teacher route. There was a constant anxiety about acquiring sufficient numbers of trained staff for Catholic post-elementary schooling: the pupil-teacher route was not an adequate preparation for this level of schooling. Skinnider (1967) commented that the body of Catholic teachers 'could not be considered an educated body' and the over reliance on pupil teachers led to an under qualified teaching force. This created major problems in the quality of teaching at senior levels of Catholic schooling in the post 1872 era.

The Catholic teachers were also working for low pay and the disparity in the salaries for the teachers in Catholic schools and Board schools was a constant source of contention for the Catholic teachers. The differential was quite marked, and the Catholic Teachers Associations continuously lobbied the Archdiocese of Glasgow for increased salaries (McKinney, 2020b).

The 18 Episcopal schools in the diocese of Glasgow and Galloway in 1853 faced similar challenges as the Catholic schools: poor attendance and an over reliance on non-certificated teachers and pupil-teachers (Meredith, 2017). In total, there were 3 certificated teachers, 16 non certificated teachers and 45 pupil-teachers in the 18 schools. The teachers in the Episcopal schools, like the Catholic teachers, were paid 'well below the average' (Edwards, 2016). They remonstrated about their low income at various points and voiced anxieties about the level of the supplement from the Church Society. In 1872, a large number of teachers signed a letter to the Bishops of the Episcopal Church complaining about a reduction in funds allocated to schools by the Church Society (Letter to Episcopal Bishops in Scotland, 1872). They argued that:

If the grant to schools is not made as heretofore, it will be impossible for many of us to retain our situations as teachers in Episcopal schools in Scotland, as we shall be unable to subsist upon what will remain of our

incomes...while it is proposed to take away a portion of our income, which, we have reason to believe, would be continued to us at the time we were appointed. We have every wish to retain our connection as teachers within the Church of which we are members, and to assist the clergy in every way within our power, and it is with reluctance we now appeal to the Right Reverend the College of Bishops for protection.

This was received favourably by the Bishops at that time as a temperate and reasonable request. There were concerns expressed by the Primus that there was a real danger that the Episcopal teachers could be tempted to seek employment in schools in England where the salaries had just been increased to a significant extent. The uncomfortable comparisons with the increasingly well-appointed Board schools and more generous salary scales of the Board school teachers continued to be a major source of contention for the teaching workforces in both Catholic and Episcopal schools throughout the post 1872 Act period. This was not resolved until the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918.

There was no Catholic training college in Scotland until 1895 and the Catholic Colleges in England were the only options for teacher training in a Catholic College. These were Mount Pleasant College, Liverpool (opened 1856), Wandsworth for women (opened 1874) and St Mary's Hammersmith for males (opened 1850). There was a very strong Scottish connection with Mount Pleasant where the majority of the female teachers for Scotland were trained in the nineteenth century (Aspinwall, 1994). Similarly, there was a strong link with St Mary's which included England, Scotland, and Wales in its catchment and two of the first secular students to enrol had been employed as pupil teachers in Edinburgh (Nicholson, 2000). These training Colleges in England were costly for the Scottish students and therefore not available for all. Nevertheless, according to Fitzpatrick (1995) there were 228 Scottish teachers who had qualified from the Catholic English Colleges by 1896: 172 at Mount Pleasant, 90 at Hammersmith and 26 at Wandsworth. The establishment of Notre Dame College in Glasgow for females in 1895 helped to alleviate the situation over time.

Before the opening of Notre Dame College, some of the religious communities were engaged in training pupil-teachers. This was especially important in the aftermath of the 1872 Act and the advent of compulsory schooling and the dependency on pupil-teachers in Catholic schools. The Sisters of Mercy in Edinburgh trained pupil-teachers at St Thomas of Aquin's College which was founded in 1886 as a centre for the Cambridge teaching Diploma. The College provided board, and this combined with the establishment of a boarding school in 1868 enabled the sisters to provide secondary school education (King, 1978). The Marist Brothers opened a Pupil-Teacher Centre in Charlotte Street Glasgow in 1874 (Fitzpatrick, 1998). Conceived as a Juniorate where the boys would be formed by the daily contact with the Brothers, this proved unsuccessful as did another attempt at a Juniorate in Dundee in 1882.

This is where the Episcopal Church had a distinct advantage, having established a Teacher Training College for the training of schoolmasters in Edinburgh in 1850. In 1866, the College was redesignated for the training of females only, due to the diminishing number of male candidates (Representative Church Council, 1878; Lochhead, 1966). The remaining male students were

relocated to Durham to continue their training. There were recurring issues about the financial viability of the College between 1852 and 1860 when expenditure was constantly in excess of income. The deficit in 1860 was £2,200 which was paid off by the Church Society. After this time the church Society granted the College an annual grant of £100. The numbers of female students grew from 11 in 1867 to 44 by 1873 and 60 by 1878. Sixty female teachers was considerably more than were required for the Episcopal schools in Scotland but the Government grants provided for the number of successful students helped to balance the budget of the College. This College would face more difficult times by the end of the nineteenth century as a result of low numbers of Scottish students and an over reliance on students from England (McKinney and Edwards, 2019). As far as can be discerned from the available sources, none of the Episcopalian religious communities were involved in formal teacher training. It is worth noting that by the end of the nineteenth century, both Notre Dame College and the Episcopal College were training female teachers exclusively, one of the signs of the feminisation of the teaching profession in the Catholic and Episcopal schools (McDermid, 2009).

CONCLUDING REMARKS

A fundamental principle of the majority of the Catholic and Episcopal schools was the strong sense of a mission to the poor. The poor children needed to be educated to contribute to society in a meaningful way, but they were also to be formed securely, where appropriate, within their own denominational tradition. Despite the seemingly altruistic and inclusive claims about the new Board schools, the Catholic and Episcopal Churches were very wary that the Christian ethos of the Board schools and the religious instruction and observance would be essentially Presbyterian and that their distinct denominational identities would be lost in the new Board schools. There were further concerns about the separation of the secular and the religious and the proposed conscience clause (and the practice of the conscience clause).

The Catholic and Episcopal Churches did not agree to transfer their schools at the time of the 1872 Act. This placed both churches in a position where they had to draw on all of the resources that were available to them. The limited funding for schools and for teacher salaries created some very precarious situations and posed serious challenges for the continuation of these forms of denominational schooling. The teachers were acutely aware of the discrepancies between their pay settlements and the salaries awarded in the Board schools. There was an over reliance on pupil-teachers which, while financially expedient, was an unsatisfactory solution to staffing problems, especially for the provision of teachers for secondary schooling. There was a long hard struggle ahead for the Catholic and Episcopal schools until the resolution offered by the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, R. D. (1995) *Education and the Scottish People, 1750-1918*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
Anderson, R.D. (1997) *Scottish Education since the Reformation*. Dundee: The Economic and Social History Society of Scotland.
Aspinwall, B. (1982) The Formation of the Catholic Community in the West of Scotland: Some Preliminary Outlines. *The Innes Review*, 33 (33), 44-57.

- Aspinwall, B. (1994) Catholic Teachers for Scotland: the Liverpool Connection. *The Innes Review*, XLV (1), 47-70.
- Bertie, D.M. (2000) *Scottish Episcopal Clergy 1869-2000*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark.
- Bischof, C.R. (2015) Schoolteachers and Professionalism 1696-1906. In Anderson, R. Freeman, M. and Paterson, L. (eds) *The Edinburgh History of Education in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. pp. 208-227.
- Colpi, T. (1993) The Scottish Italian Community: senza un campanile? *The Innes Review*, 44 (2), 153-167.
- Cruikshank, M. (1970) *A History of the Training of Teachers in Scotland*. London: University of London Press.
- Devine, T. M. (2006) *The Scottish Nation*. London: Penguin Books.
- Dilworth, M. (1978) Religious Orders in Scotland, 1878-1978. *The Innes Review*, 29 (1), 92-109.
- Eden, R. (1881) *The Past and Present Position of the Episcopal Church in Scotland. A Sermon preached in Thurso on Sunday 14th August, 1891*.
<http://anglicanhistory.org/scotland/reden/thurso1881.html>
- Edinburgh Evening News (1874) *Episcopal Church Congress*, 20 May.
- Edinburgh Evening News (1876) *Episcopal Church Representative Council*, 12 October.
- Education (Scotland) Act 1872
- Education (Scotland) Act 1918
- Edwards, R. (2016). *Some Thoughts on Victorian Episcopal Schools*. Paper presented to Scottish Episcopal Church Historians' Group. Glenalmond College, 19 March.
- Fitzpatrick, T.A. (1986) *Catholic Secondary Education in South-West Scotland before 1872*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.
- Fitzpatrick, T.A. (1995) *No Mean Service*. Glasgow: John S. Burns and Sons.
- Fitzpatrick, T.A. (1998) The Marist Brothers in Scotland before 1918. *The Innes Review*, 49 (1), 1-10.
- Fitzpatrick, T.A. (2000) Catholic Education. In Holmes, H. (ed.) *Scottish Life and Society. A Compendium of Scottish Ethnology*. East Lothian: Tuckwell Press. pp. 435-455
- Goldie, F. (1976) *A Short History of the Episcopal Church in Scotland*. Edinburgh: St. Andrew's Press.
- Hamilton, S.L. (2011). The Architecture and Impact of the School Boards in Glasgow. *Architectural Heritage*, XXII, 115-136.
- Handley, J.E. (1950) French Influence on Scottish Catholic Education in the Nineteenth Century. *Innes Review*, 1 (1), 22-34.
- Handley, J.E. (1958) *The History of St. Mungo's Academy*. Paisley: John Aitken & Sons.
- Harding, A. (2007) A Victorian Church in Edinburgh's Old Town: St. Columba's Episcopal Church in Contention. *Scottish Church History*, 37 (1), 121-144.
- Holy Trinity Scottish Episcopal Church (2021) *Rev. Clement Leigh Caldwell, M.A. (1874-1903)*
- Kehoe, S.K. (2010) *Creating a Scottish Church. Catholicism, gender and ethnicity in nineteenth-century Scotland*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Kenneth, Br. (1968) The Education (Scotland) Act, 1918, in the Making. *The Innes Review*, 19 (2), 91-128.
- King, M. I. (1978) *Sisters of Mercy of Great Britain. 1839-1978*. Glasgow: John S. Burns & Sons.
- Knox, H. M. (1953) *Two Hundred and Fifty Years of Scottish Education*. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd.
- Letter to the Right Reverend The Bishops of the Episcopal Church in Scotland (1872)*. National Records of Scotland: CH12/77/1.
- Lochhead, M. (1966) *Episcopal Scotland in the Nineteenth Century*. London: John Murray.
- Luscombe, E. (2014/15) *The Voluntary Poor. Religious Communities of the Scottish Episcopal Church*. Arbroath: Premier Print Works Limited.
- Meredith, I. (2017) *Lost and Forgotten. Irish Episcopalians in the West of Scotland 1817-1929*. Amazon CreateSpace.
- McDermid, J. (1996) Catholic working-class girls' education in Lowland Scotland, 1872-1900. *The Innes Review*, 47 (1), 69-80.
- McDermid, J. (2009) Catholic Women teachers and Scottish education in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. *History of Education*, 38 (5), 605-620.
- McKinney, S. J. (2020a) Working conditions for Catholic teachers in the archdiocese of Glasgow in the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century. *The Innes Review*, 71 (1), 67-84.

- McKinney, S.J. (2020b) Catholic Teacher Preparation, Shanks, R. (Ed.) *Teacher Preparation in Scotland (Emerald Studies in Teacher Preparation in National and Global Contexts)*, Emerald Publishing Limited, pp. 165-178.
- McKinney, S. J. and Edwards, R. (2020), A Concise History of the Episcopal Teacher Training College in Scotland, Shanks, R. (Ed.) *Teacher Preparation in Scotland (Emerald Studies in Teacher Preparation in National and Global Contexts)*, Emerald Publishing Limited, pp. 179-186.
- Nicholson, N. (2000) St Mary's College Hammersmith: Its Early Development in the Context of Mid-Nineteenth Century Teacher Training. In Eaton, M., Longmore, J. and Naylor, A. (eds) *Commitment to Diversity. Catholics and Education in a Changing World*. London: Cassell. pp.115-162
- O'Hagan, F.J. (2006) *The Contribution of the Religious Orders to Education in Glasgow during the period 1847-1918*. Lampeter: Edwin Mellon Press.
- O'Hagan, F.J. and Davis, R.A. (2007) Forging the Compact of church and State in the development of Catholic education in late nineteenth century Scotland. *The Innes Review*, 58 (1), 72-94.
- Representative Church Council of the Scottish Episcopal Church (1878) *Draft for suggested report by Education Board meeting on 20th June 1878*. National Records of Scotland: CH12/77/1.
- Ross, A. (1978) The Development of the Scottish Catholic Community 1878-1978. *Innes Review*, 29 (1), 30-55.
- Sadlier's Catholic Directory (1891)
https://www.google.co.uk/books/edition/Sadliers_Catholic_Directory_Almanac_and/uenQAAAAMA_AJ?hl=en&gbpv=1&dq=st+Andrews+catholic+cathedral+dundee&pg=RA3-PA139&printsec=frontcover
- Scotland, J. (1969a) *The History of Scottish Education*, Volume One. London: University of London Press.
- Scotland, J. (1969b) *The History of Scottish Education*, Volume Two. London: University of London Press.
- Scott, H. (1870a) *The Schools of the Scottish Episcopal Church No. I*. Aberdeen: A. Brown & Co.
- Scott, H. (1870b) *The Schools of the Scottish Episcopal Church No. II*. Aberdeen: A. Brown & Co.
- Scott, H. (1871) *The Schools of the Scottish Episcopal Church No. III*. Aberdeen: A. Brown & Co.
- Scott, H. (1872) *The Schools of the Scottish Episcopal Church No. IV*. Aberdeen: A. Brown & Co.
- Skinnder, M. (1967) *Catholic Elementary Education in Glasgow, 1818-1918*. In Bone, T.R. (ed.) *Studies in the History of Scottish Education*. London: University of London Press Ltd. pp.13-170.
- Stewart, I. (1995) Teacher Careers and the Early Catholic Schools of Edinburgh. *The Innes Review*, Volume XLVI, (1), 52-66
- Strong, R. (2002) *Episcopalianism in Nineteenth-Century Scotland*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- The Dundee Directory (1885-1886)
https://www.google.co.uk/books/edition/The_Dundee_directory/5CMOAAAQAQAJ?hl=en&gbpv=1&dq=st+Andrews+catholic+cathedral+dundee&pg=RA1-PA16&printsec=frontcover
- The Scotsman (1877) *Representative Council of the Scottish Episcopal Church*. 12 October.
- The Scotsman (1881) *Episcopal Church Conference*. 12 October.
- The Scotsman (1882) *Scottish Episcopal Church Schools*. 23 June.
- The Scottish Witness (1868) *St. Mary's School*. May.
- Treble, J. H. (1978). The development of Roman Catholic Education in Scotland 1878 – 1978. *The Innes Review*, 29 (1), 111-139.
- Treble, J. H. (1980). The working of the 1918 Education Act in Glasgow Archdiocese. *The Innes Review*, 31 (1), 27-44.
- Vaughan, G. (2012) 'Papists looking after the Education of our Protestant Children!' Catholics and Protestants on western Scottish school boards, 1872-1918. *The Innes Review*, 63 (1), 30-47.
- White, G. (1998) *The Scottish Episcopal Church. A New History*. Edinburgh: General Synod of the Scottish Episcopal Church
- Wilson, J.D. (1967) The Junior Students System. In T. R. Bone (Ed.), *Studies in the History of Scottish Education 1872-1939*. London: University of London Press. pp. 191-242.