Capabilities: a means to reframe policy interventions from a social justice perspective?

Sarah Ward – PhD Researcher
Overview

• Health inequalities in Scotland

• Asset Based Community Development (ABCD)

• Capabilities dialogue on social justice – what the empirical evidence revealed about Asset Based Community Development
Health policies are failing to address inequalities

- Lack of political will/lack of popular support
- Focus on ‘gap’ not ‘gradient’
- Policy silos
- ‘Lifestyle drift’: policy to practice
- Difficulty translating research into policy solutions
3 key measures to address policy failure:

- Streamlining services
- Shift towards prevention
- Community involvement in service planning and delivery, in form of ‘assets approaches’
PhD Research Project

- Asset Based Community Development pilot (ABCD) – AHEAD Project, Ayrshire, Scotland
- 4 year pilot in 8 disadvantaged communities across SW Scotland
- Evaluate the ABCD theory of change against empirical evidence
- Qualitative case study approach
  - Doc evidence, fieldwork diary, 30 in-depth interviews
ABCD Theory of Change

Figure 1.1 ABCD Theory of Change
(From Chapter 3: Assets theory literature review - Identifying mechanisms within the ABCD logic model)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>ABCD Step</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Identify assets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Build relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mobilise assets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Build local associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Develop community vision for change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Invite professional input</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PROBLEM: ‘Broken' community/ Socio-economic deprivation

GOAL: Improved mental health and wellbeing

ABCD Intervention
### ABCD Theory of Change and mechanisms

#### Mechanism Description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mech</th>
<th>Mechanism description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Identity connectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Hold conversations with local people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Introduce people with shared interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Generate activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Build association across activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Associations come together to plan local vision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Engage professionals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Figure 1.2 ABCD Theory of Change with mapped mechanisms

(From Chapter 3: Assets theory literature review - Identifying mechanisms within the ABCD logic model)

PROBLEM: 'Broken' community/Socio-economic deprivation

1. Identify assets
2. Build relationships
3. Mobilise assets
4. Build local associations
5. Develop community vision for change

GOAL: Improved mental health and wellbeing

ABCD Intervention

6. Invite professional input
ABCD Theory of Change and mechanism irregularities

Mechanism Irregularities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>Identity connectors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Hold conversations with local people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Introduce people with shared interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Generate activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Build association across activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Associations come together to plan local vision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Engage professionals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1.2 ABCD Theory of Change with mapped mechanisms and mechanism irregularity
(From Chapter 3: Assets theory literature review - Identifying mechanisms within the ABCD logic model)
Why use Capabilities?

- Explore social justice potential of ABCD
  (‘conscious relocation of authority’)
- Legitimise conversations/side-step rehearsed responses
- Identify locally generated domains and functionings
  (based on EMF, Alkire et al. (2009))
- CA aligns with Social Determinants of Health
- Can CA help with ABCD mechanism irregularities?
Methodology

• Qualitative case study
• 30 interviews
• Structured into 3 parts:
  • Experiences of ABCD
  • Capabilities domains
  • Potential for ABCD to contribute to structural change
• ‘Top 5’ domains (Wolff and De-Shalit, 2007)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Capability Domain</th>
<th>Functionings</th>
<th>ABCD Mechanism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 4   | Identity, Expression & Self Respect | • Have freedom of expression  
• Build a sense of communal identity and belonging  
• Engage in cultural practices, in community with other members of your chosen group or groups and across communities  
• Have self-respect  
• Be confident that you will be treated with dignity and respect  
• Access and use public spaces freely | B/C/D E/D C/B/D D |
| 8   | Productive & Valued Activity       | • Do something useful and have the value of your work recognised even if unpaid                                                                                                                                | D             |
| 9   | Participation & Voice             | • Make decisions affecting your own life  
• Get together with others  
• Participate in the local community  
• Participate in locally-led decision-making  
• Participate in non-governmental organisations concerned with public and political life  
• Participate in the formulation of government policy, locally and nationally  
• Form and join civil organisations and solidarity groups | B/C/D E/F E/F |
| 5   | Individual, Family & Social Relationships | • Spend time with others  
• Develop as a person  
• Formulate and pursue goals and objectives for yourself  
• Hope for the future  
• Access emotional support  
• Know that someone will look out for you  
• Have peace of mind  
• Form friendships  
• Develop and maintain self-respect, self-esteem and self-confidence | D/B/E C/D E/F C/C C/C |
| 2   | Health                            | • Mental wellbeing through social networks                                                                                                                                                                    | C             |
## Participation and Voice Functionings – progression across Theory of Change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain Ref</th>
<th>Domain Functioning</th>
<th>ABCD Mechanism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PVi</td>
<td>Make decisions affecting your own life</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVii</td>
<td>Get together with others</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PViii</td>
<td>Participate in the local community</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PViv</td>
<td>Participate in locally-led decision making</td>
<td>E/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVv</td>
<td>Participate in non-governmental orgs concerned with public and political life</td>
<td>E/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVvi</td>
<td>Form and join civil organisations and solidarity groups</td>
<td>E/F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PVvii</td>
<td>Participate in the formulation of government policy, locally and nationally</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABCD ToC with Capabilities functionings

Figure 1.4 ABCD Theory of Change with mapped mechanisms and 4 (of 5) Capabilities Domains

PROBLEM: 'Broken' community/Socio-economic deprivation

GOAL: Improved mental health and wellbeing

ABC Intervention

Key:
- 1-6 = ABCD process stages
- A-F = ABCD mechanisms
- IDii-IDiv = Identity, Expression & Self Respect
- ACTi = Productive & Valued Activity
- RELi-RELix = Individual, family & social relationships
- HLi = Health
ABCD ToC with Participation & Voice functionings

Figure 1.5 ABCD Theory of Change with mapped mechanisms and Participation and Voice functionings

Key:
- 1-5 = ABCD process stages
- A-P = ABCD hypothetical mechanisms
- PVi-PVvii = Capability Functionings for “Participation & Voice”, mapped onto mechanisms

PROBLEM: 'Broken' community/Socio-economic deprivation

GOAL: Improved mental health and wellbeing

1. Identify assets
2. Build relationships
3. Mobilise assets
4. Build local associations
5. Develop community vision for change
6. Invite professional input

ABCD Intervention
Next steps

- Agency
  How does PV relate to agency?
  How do concepts of agency in CA relate to those in Community Development radical practical?
  How to map the development of agency over time?

Thanks for listening … feedback welcomed!
Thanks for listening …
… feedback welcome!

Sarah Ward
University of Glasgow
s.ward.1@research.gla.ac.uk