

Tremblay, M. M., Shuster, D. L., Balco, G. and Cassata, W. S. (2017) Neon diffusion kinetics and implications for cosmogenic neon paleothermometry in feldspars. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 205, pp. 14-30.

There may be differences between this version and the published version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

http://eprints.gla.ac.uk/149298/

Deposited on: 10 October 2017

Enlighten – Research publications by members of the University of Glasgow http://eprints.gla.ac.uk

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	Neon diffusion kinetics and implications for cosmogenic neon
7	paleothermometry in feldspars
8	
9 10	Marissa M. Tremblay <sup>1,2,*</sup> , David L. Shuster <sup>1,2</sup> , Greg Balco <sup>2</sup> , and William S. Cassata <sup>3</sup>
11	1. Department of Earth and Planetary Science, University of California, Berkeley, 307
12	McCone Hall #4767, Berkeley, CA 94720-4767, USA
13	2. Berkeley Geochronology Center, 2455 Ridge Road, Berkeley, CA 94709, USA
14	3. Chemical Sciences Division, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, 7000 East Avenue
15	(L-231), Livermore, CA 94550, USA
16	*Corresponding author.
17	
18	Email addresses: mtremblay@berkeley.edu (M.M. Tremblay), dshuster@berkeley.edu (D.L.
19	Shuster), balcs@bgc.org (G. Balco), cassata2@llnl.gov.
20	Phone number: 603-203-4976 (M.M. Tremblay)
21	
22	Keywords: cosmogenic nuclide; noble gas; diffusion; thermochronometry; paleoclimate; surface
23	processes
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	

## 30 Abstract

31 Observations of cosmogenic neon concentrations in feldspars can potentially be used to constrain 32 the surface exposure duration or surface temperature history of geologic samples. The applicability of cosmogenic neon to either application depends on the temperature-dependent 33 34 diffusivity of neon isotopes. In this work, we investigate the kinetics of neon diffusion in 35 feldspars of different compositions and geologic origins through stepwise degassing experiments 36 on single, proton-irradiated crystals. To understand the potential causes of complex diffusion 37 behavior that is sometimes manifest as nonlinearity in Arrhenius plots, we compare our results to 38 argon stepwise degassing experiments previously conducted on the same feldspars. Many of the feldspars we studied exhibit linear Arrhenius behavior for neon whereas argon degassing from 39 40 the same feldspars did not. This suggests that nonlinear behavior in argon experiments is an 41 artifact of structural changes during laboratory heating. However, other feldspars that we 42 examined exhibit nonlinear Arrhenius behavior for neon diffusion at temperatures far below any 43 known structural changes, which suggests that some preexisting material property is responsible for the complex behavior. In general, neon diffusion kinetics vary widely across the different 44 feldspars studied, with estimated activation energies ( $E_a$ ) ranging from 83.3 to 110.7 kJ/mol and 45 apparent pre-exponential factors ( $D_0$ ) spanning three orders of magnitude from 2.4 x 10<sup>-3</sup> to 8.9 x 46  $10^{-1}$  cm<sup>2</sup>s<sup>-1</sup>. As a consequence of this variability, the ability to reconstruct temperatures or 47 48 exposure durations from cosmogenic neon abundances will depend on both the specific feldspar 49 and the surface temperature conditions at the geologic site of interest.

50

### 51 1. Introduction

52 In noble gas thermochronometry, the thermal histories of geologic materials are inferred from the

53 concurrent production and thermally-activated diffusion of noble gases. These thermal histories 54 can be used to understand geologic processes occurring over a vast range of temperatures and 55 timescales, from erosion-driven exhumation of rocks over millions of years (e.g., Herman et al., 2013, and references therein) to near instantaneous high-temperature impact events (e.g., Min et 56 al., 2004; Cassata et al., 2010; Jourdan et al., 2011). Feldspar minerals are frequently utilized for 57 58 noble gas thermochronometry because they are abundant in silicic rocks and have compositions that permit high noble gas production rates from both radioactive decay (radiogenic noble gases) 59 60 and *in situ* nuclear interactions with secondary cosmic-ray particles (cosmogenic noble gases). Since its development nearly half a century ago, feldspar  ${}^{40}$ Ar/ ${}^{39}$ Ar thermochronometry, which 61 utilizes the production and diffusion of radiogenic <sup>40</sup>Ar, has been extensively used to study 62 crustal and surface processes both on Earth (e.g., Richter et al., 1991; Hodges et al., 2005) and 63 other planetary bodies (e.g., Turner, 1971; Shuster et al., 2010). More recently, cosmogenic 64 65 argon in feldspars has been used to reconstruct planetary surface temperatures (e.g., Shuster and 66 Cassata, 2015). Cosmogenic neon in feldspars can, in theory, also be used for surface temperature thermochronometry (Tremblay et al., 2014a; Garrick-Bethell et al., 2017). If neon is 67 quantitatively retained in feldspars at planetary surface temperatures, cosmogenic neon 68 69 measurements can also be used to determine surface exposure durations (e.g., Kober et al., 70 2005).

71

The production and diffusion systematics of a particular noble gas-mineral pair must be known
for thermochronometric or geochronologic applications. Here, we focus on empirical
quantification of neon diffusion kinetics in feldspars, with the goal of examining whether
cosmogenic neon can be used for surface paleothermometry (Tremblay et al., 2014a). The only

existing constraints on neon diffusion in feldspars were reported by Gourbet et al. (2012), who 76 examined the diffusion kinetics of neutron-induced <sup>22</sup>Ne in three alkali feldspars through 77 stepwise degassing experiments. Orthoclase and Ca-rich anorthoclase exhibited relatively simple 78 neon diffusion behavior expressed as a linear relationship between the logarithm of diffusivity 79 and inverse temperature (although the linearity of the orthoclase experiment has been questioned 80 81 (Lovera et al., 2015)), while Fish Canyon Tuff sanidine did not. The range in Arrhenius diffusion 82 parameters (activation energy,  $E_a$ , and pre-exponential factor,  $D_0$ ) calculated by Gourbet et al. 83 (2012) suggest that neon can be quantitatively retained at Earth surface temperatures over 84 millions of years, in the case of the orthoclase studied, or diffusively lost on thousand year timescales, in the case of anorthoclase and sanidine. 85

86

Several questions remain from these initial experiments reported by Gourbet et al. (2012) that we
aim to address. First, what is the kinetics of neon diffusion in plagioclase feldspars? Gourbet et
al. (2012) studied three alkali feldspars; no experimental work has quantified the kinetics of neon
diffusion in plagioclases. To fill this gap, we present results from stepwise degassing
experiments on three plagioclase feldspars. We also discuss results from a stepwise degassing
experiment on an endmember plagioclase feldspar from lunar sample 76535 (Garrick-Bethell et
al., 2017).

94

Second, how do the kinetics and behaviors of neon and argon diffusion compare? In contrast to
neon, there is a vast literature exploring the kinetics of argon diffusion in feldspars. Some of the
earliest studies examining argon in geologic materials (e.g., Reynolds, 1957; Fechtig et al., 1960;
Evernden et al., 1960; Gerling et al., 1963) found evidence for complex diffusion behavior in

99 feldspars, which has been observed numerous times since (e.g. Lovera et al., 1997, and 100 references therein; Berger and York, 1981; Harrison and McDougall, 1982; Cassata and Renne, 101 2013). The origin and significance of complex argon diffusion behavior, which is observed as 102 both nonlinear Arrhenius arrays and age spectra with multiple plateaus, has been discussed at 103 length. Multiple diffusion domain (MDD) theory (Lovera and Richter, 1989; Lovera et al., 1991; 104 Harrison et al., 1991) posits that complex diffusion behavior results from argon diffusing from 105 multiple, non-interacting subgrain domains of different sizes that are stable both during the 106 geologic history and laboratory heating of a feldspar. Others have suggested that complex argon 107 diffusion behavior may also arise due to structural modifications, microtextural development, 108 fluid alteration, or some combination therein (e.g., Villa, 2006; Parsons et al., 1999; Lovera et 109 al., 2002; McLaren et al., 2007; Villa and Hanchar, 2013; Cassata and Renne, 2013). In these 110 cases, the timing of various mineralogical changes with respect to the thermal history of a 111 feldspar matter greatly to the interpretation of complex argon diffusion behavior.

112

113 For planetary surface paleothermometry using cosmogenic neon, any subgrain alteration during 114 the geologic history of a feldspar will have occurred at higher temperatures than those of interest, 115 but will likely still affect the kinetics of neon diffusion at low temperature. It is thus important to 116 distinguish complex neon behavior due to any existing crystallochemical heterogeneities from 117 that resulting from potential structural changes during laboratory heating. In previous work on 118 noble gas diffusion in quartz (Tremblay et al., 2014b), we made this distinguishment by 119 examining diffusion of both helium and neon in the same aliquots. If structural alteration during 120 laboratory heating changes diffusion kinetics, we would expect deviations from a linear 121 Arrhenius array to occur at a common temperature for both noble gases. On the other hand, if

some stable subgrain property is responsible for complex diffusion behavior, then we anticipate
the temperature at which deviation from Arrhenius linearity occurs to differ for different noble
gases.

125

126 In a similar manner, in this work we present neon stepwise degassing experiments on a subset of 127 the feldspars for which Cassata and Renne (2013) conducted argon stepwise degassing 128 experiments. Cassata and Renne (2013) argued that a combination of temperature-dependent 129 structural transitions and the presence of multiple diffusion domains caused deviations from 130 linear Arrhenius behavior in their experiments. Here, we designed our experiments such that the 131 majority of the neon present was released at temperatures lower than those used by Cassata and 132 Renne (2013) to characterize argon diffusion. As a result, all deviations from linear Arrhenius behavior interpreted by Cassata and Renne (2013) to be a result of structural transitions should 133 134 be absent from our neon experiments, if their interpretation is correct. We also examined 135 feldspars that exhibit linear Arrhenius behavior for argon diffusion to determine whether simple 136 diffusion behavior is also observed for neon. If simple diffusion behavior is observed for both 137 noble gases in a particular feldspar, it suggests that there is a single diffusion domain with a 138 single diffusion lengthscale, which may equal the physical grain size of the aliquots analyzed. In 139 these cases, our experimental results and those of Cassata and Renne (2013) can be compared 140 with theoretical calculations of argon and neon diffusivities.

141

In addition to addressing the questions outlined above, we use our experimentally-determined diffusion kinetics to model the sensitivity of cosmogenic neon diffusion to temperature and exposure duration amongst different feldspars. We use the modeled sensitivities to evaluate the

potential for using cosmogenic neon in feldspar to constrain past planetary surface temperatures.

### 147 **2. Methods**

148 We conducted neon stepwise degassing experiments on a suite of feldspar that span the full 149 range of feldspar compositions from orthoclase to anorthite. Brief sample descriptions including 150 compositions are provided in Table 1; for more detailed information, see Cassata and Renne 151 (2013) and references therein. Samples were irradiated with a 220 MeV proton beam for 5 hours 152 at the Francis H. Burr Proton Therapy Center at the Massachusetts General Hospital. Numerous 153 grains from a given sample were packed together into an Sn foil in order to balance ejection of 154 proton-induced Ne with implantation (e.g., Shuster et al., 2004). These Sn foils were packaged 155 into HDPE capsules (9.4 mm in diameter, 3.0 in mm height), which were stacked into quartz 156 tubes to form a ~500 mm long cylindrical target; the approximate range of 220 MeV protons in 157 HDPE is 300 mm. A 100 µm thick Pb foil in front of the target stack, in conjunction with the 158 target stack itself, defocuses and scatters the proton beam intensity in attempt to evenly distribute 159 the cross-section flux (Shuster et al., 2004, Shuster and Farley, 2005a). The target was flipped 160 halfway through the irradiation to ensure Ne production in both ends of the target stack despite 161 proton energy dissipation; the feldspars examined here were located within 150 mm of either end 162 of the target stack. Sample temperatures do not exceed 45 °C during irradiation (Shuster and 163 Farely, 2005b). Proton irradiation of the feldspars examined here took place in April 2013 with a total proton fluence of  $\sim 8.5 \times 10^{15}$  p/cm<sup>2</sup>, which was measured during irradiation by a thin foil 164 transmission ionization chamber in front of the beam aperture. 165

166



168 500 µm in radius (Shuster and Farley, 2005a) if the crystal fragments are compositionally 169 uniform. With the exception of Fish Canyon sanidine and Grass Valley anorthite, the feldspars 170 studied here are compositionally homogeneous with respect to these elements (Cassata and 171 Renne, 2013) and we therefore expect proton-induced Ne to be spatially uniform. The production 172 of uniform, high concentrations of neon isotopes from proton irradiation allows us to conduct 173 stepwise degassing experiments on single feldspar crystals (Shuster et al., 2004; Shuster and 174 Farley, 2005b; Tremblay et al., 2014b). Implications for compositional zonation of Fish Canvon 175 sanidine and Grass Valley anorthite are detailed in the discussion.

176

177 The effects of lattice damage from proton irradiation on noble gas diffusion in feldspars has not 178 been explicitly investigated. Previous work empirically demonstrates that lattice damage 179 generated during proton irradiation with the magnitude of fluence and energy used here does not 180 significantly modify noble gas diffusion kinetics in other mineral phases (Shuster et al., 2004; 181 Shuster and Farley, 2005b; Tremblay et al., 2014). Although neutron irradiation, which typically 182 has 2–3 orders of magnitude higher fluence than proton irradiation, has been shown to influence noble gas diffusion in apatite (Shuster and Farley, 2009), several studies have demonstrated that 183 184 damage generated during neutron irradiation minimally affects argon diffusion kinetics (Foland 185 and Xu, 1990; Lovera et al., 1993; Cassata and Renne, 2013). Given this set of observations, we 186 therefore assume that damage produced during proton irradiation does not significantly modify 187 neon diffusion kinetics in feldspars, although this assumption should be tested with replicate 188 experiments on aliquots irradiated with different proton fluences and energies.

189

190 Proton irradiated feldspars were inspected by binocular microscopy to select individual crystals

191 lacking penetrative fractures and visible inclusions. Selected crystals were photographed to 192 estimate crystal dimensions (Fig. S1) and then placed under vacuum inside Pt-Ir alloy packets 193 affixed to K-type thermocouples. Packets were heated with either a 30 or 150 W diode laser in a 194 feedback control loop with the thermocouple via a PID temperature controller, enabling us to 195 maintain a setpoint temperature to within 2 °C. Samples were heated in fifty or more consecutive 196 heating steps to temperatures between 100 and 1200 °C. Each heating schedule contained at least 197 two retrograde heating cycles, and individual heating steps lasted between 0.5 and 4 hours. All 198 measurements were made on an MAP 215-50 sector field mass spectrometer in the Noble Gas 199 Thermochronometry Lab of the Berkeley Geochronology Center; gas purification and mass spectrometric measurement techniques are detailed in Tremblay et al. (2014b). For <sup>21</sup>Ne, we 200 made no isobaric interference corrections; the MAP 215-50 cannot resolve <sup>20</sup>Ne<sup>1</sup>H from <sup>21</sup>Ne, 201 and we assume corrections due to this isobaric interference are negligible. <sup>21</sup>Ne background 202 203 corrections were made by subtracting the average of six or more room temperature procedural 204 blanks measured over the course of each experiment from measurement time-zero intercepts; the average correction for <sup>21</sup>Ne across all experiments was 0.06 x 10<sup>6</sup> atoms. <sup>20</sup>Ne and <sup>22</sup>Ne have 205 isobaric interferences from  ${}^{40}\text{Ar}^{++}$  and  ${}^{44}\text{CO}_2^{++}$ , respectively, which the MAP 215-50 sector field 206 mass spectrometer used for these experiments also cannot resolve. Although these interferences 207 can be corrected for by introducing an <sup>39</sup>Ar spike during neon measurements and observing a 208 linear relationship between the  $Ar^{++}/Ar^{+}$  and  $CO_{2}^{++}/CO^{2+}$  ratios (Balco and Shuster, 2009), we 209 did not use the spike procedure during these experiments. Instead, we assumed that all of the 210  $^{22}$ Ne signal observed during room-temperature procedural blanks was entirely from  $^{44}CO_2^{++}$  and 211 used the average blank 44/22 ratio and measured  ${}^{44}CO_2^+$  signals to correct measured  ${}^{22}Ne$  signals 212 during heating steps.<sup>20</sup>Ne was not measured. Experiments were terminated when three or more 213

consecutive heating steps yielded <sup>21</sup>Ne and <sup>22</sup>Ne time-zero intercepts at or below background 214 level. We determined total neon amounts by comparison with the time-zero intercepts of a 215 manometrically-calibrated air standard. Measurement of different calibrated pipette volumes of 216 the air standard demonstrated that <sup>21</sup>Ne sensitivity was constant over the pressure range of the 217 analyses in a given experiment. Blank corrected <sup>21</sup>Ne and <sup>22</sup>Ne abundances for each heating step 218 are reported in Table S1. The magnitude of the isobaric interference correction on <sup>22</sup>Ne signals 219 220 for individual heating steps varies between 5 and 100%, with an average correction of  $\sim$ 50%. These generally large-magnitude corrections propagate into very large <sup>22</sup>Ne uncertainties; 221 therefore we do not use the <sup>22</sup>Ne data further. The concentrations of <sup>21</sup>Ne and <sup>22</sup>Ne present in the 222 individual feldspar crystals analyzed (>  $10^{12}$  atoms/g) are orders of magnitude greater than any 223 likely combination of atmospheric, cosmogenic, and nucleogenic neon components present prior 224 to proton irradiation, which for terrestrial samples are typically on the order of  $10^6$ – $10^8$  atoms/g 225 226 (e.g., Gourbet et al., 2012; Kober et al., 2005). We therefore assume that contributions from these components are negligible in comparison to the uniformly distributed, proton-induced 227 neon, and that variations in the  ${}^{21}$ Ne/ ${}^{22}$ Ne ratio between different heating steps reflect the very 228 uncertain isobaric interference correction made for <sup>22</sup>Ne. 229

230

We used the equations of Fechtig and Kalbitzer (1966) to calculate lengthscale-normalized diffusivities  $(D/a^2)$  from the fraction of <sup>21</sup>Ne measured and duration of each heating step for each stepwise degassing experiment. By using these equations, we make several assumptions. First, we assume that Ne diffusion is both Fickian and isotropic (Crank, 1975). Ar stepwise degassing experiments on cleavage flakes with different lattice orientations indicate isotropic diffusion in feldspars at the temperatures over which we conduct neon step degassing experiments (Cassata

237 and Renne, 2013). Second, we assume that the initial distribution of the diffusant is spatially 238 uniform; proton irradiation should generate Ne uniformly, as discussed above. Third, we assume 239 that each feldspar crystal has a spherical, fixed geometry. We approximate the spherically 240 equivalent radius of the samples used in our experiments as the radius of a sphere whose surface 241 area to volume ratio equals that of the crystal analyzed. Previous work demonstrates that this 242 assumption is valid for materials with moderate aspect ratios, even for crystals with realistic 243 shapes or irregular geometries (Meesters and Dunai, 2002; Gautheron and Tassan-Got, 2010; 244 Huber et al., 2011).

245

We first estimated the surface to volume ratio of the crystals from optical microscopy 246 247 measurements. Since feldspars do not have distinctive crystal habits and frequently bear surface irregularities such as cleavage steps, we had to make simplifying assumptions about the crystal 248 249 geometries to make these estimates. To overcome this limitation, we obtained accurate surface 250 area to volume ratio and size determinations of the feldspar crystals by X-ray computed 251 tomography. X-ray computed tomography (CT) allows for three-dimensional, nondestructive 252 characterization of geologic samples based on the variable attenuation of X-rays as they travel 253 through different materials (Ketcham and Carlson, 2001). After the stepwise degassing 254 experiments, we extracted each crystal from its packet to look for evidence of fracturing. Intact 255 fragments were mounted on double sided tape and scanned with 3.15 µm resolution on the 256 Xradia MicroXCT scanner at the University of Texas at Austin High-Resolution X-ray CT 257 Facility. Using the software Blob3D (Ketcham, 2005), feldspar crystals were segmented from 258 mounting material using a grayscale threshold and separated into individual crystal volumes. We 259 extracted numerous statistics about these volumes, including surface area, volume, aspect ratio,

and maximum and minimum axis lengths, and calculated spherically equivalent radii of thecrystals for comparison with our first estimates (Table S2).

262

263 **3. Results** 

264 Results of the neon stepwise degassing experiments are reported in Table S1 and plotted in Figs. 1A–6A, where the natural logarithm of calculated diffusivities  $(ln(D/a^2))$ , where D is diffusivity 265 266 and *a* is the diffusive lengthscale) is shown as a function of inverse temperature. Figs. 1A–6A 267 also show the results from argon stepwise degassing experiments on different grains of the same 268 feldspars reported by Cassata and Renne (2013). Additionally, in Fig. 7 we compare the result of 269 a neon stepwise degassing experiment on a neutron-irradiated crystal of anorthite from lunar troctolite 76535 (Garrick-Bethell et al., 2017) to an <sup>37</sup>Ar stepwise degassing experiment on 270 271 76535 anorthite reported by Cassata and Renne (2013). For both neon and argon datasets, we use 272 the Monte Carlo approach described by Tremblay et al. (2014b) to propagate uncertainties in gas 273 release fraction into calculated diffusivities. If the temperature dependence of noble gas diffusion 274 is Arrhenian and the feldspar analyzed is characterized by a single diffusion domain, then we 275 expect to observe a linear correlation in this plotting space. In many cases we observe significant 276 deviations from linearity; however, for all stepwise degassing experiments at least a subset of the 277 data collected comprises a linear array. We fit least squares regressions to these subsets in Figs. 278 1A-7A, with the goal of including as many temperature steps as possible in the regression while 279 minimizing the residuals between the regression and the data. We used these regressions and the Monte-Carlo derived uncertainties in  $D/a^2$  to estimate the activation energy ( $E_a$ ) and diffusion 280 coefficient  $(D_0/a^2)$  from the slope and intercept of the linear regression, respectively, assuming 281 282 an Arrhenius dependence of diffusivity on temperature:

283 
$$\frac{D}{a^2} = \frac{D_0}{a^2} exp\left(\frac{-E_a}{RT}\right)$$

where *R* is the gas constant and *T* is absolute temperature. These calculated diffusion parameters
are reported in Table 2. While the significance of these calculated diffusion parameters is in
some cases uncertain, as will be discussed below, fitting these regressions allows us to compare
the temperatures and gas fractions over which linear Arrhenius behavior is observed. These
comparisons are shown in Figs. 1B–7B and 1C–7C as residuals, which we define as the
difference between the calculated diffusivity from a given heating step and the expected
diffusivity from the linear regression at the same temperature.

292 The two neon stepwise degassing experiments we conducted on Fish Canyon sanidine exhibited 293 single linear Arrhenius arrays over the duration of the experiment, which was also observed in 294 replicate argon stepwise degassing experiments (Fig. 1). Deviation from linearity occurs at the 295 end of neon experiment A; however, this deviation comprises less than 7% of the cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne released (Fig. 1C), and the remaining steps do not form any clear additional linear arrays 296 (Fig. 1A). Interestingly, our stepwise degassing experiments using proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne disagree 297 significantly with the experiment using neutron-induced <sup>22</sup>Ne reported by Gourbet et al. (2012), 298 299 which showed complex neon diffusion behavior (Fig.1A). Neon and argon stepwise degassing 300 experiments on Gulf of Salerno sanidine likewise exhibit simple, linear Arrhenius behavior (Fig. 301 2). Although several of the high-temperature steps in the neon stepwise degassing experiment 302 deviate from a linear Arrhenius array (Fig. 2B), these steps constitute less than 10% of the cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne released (Fig. 2C) and do not form any clear additional linear arrays (Fig. 2A). 303 304



306 experiment on Benson Mines orthoclase shows a clear downward deviation from linear Arrhenius behavior at  $\sim$ 70% of the cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne release fraction (Figs. 3A and 3C). A second 307 linear Arrhenius array, which includes a retrograde heating cycle, is observed at higher <sup>21</sup>Ne 308 release fractions (Fig. 3A). For comparison, we show the results of an <sup>39</sup>Ar stepwise degassing 309 experiment reported by Cassata and Renne (2013) on an equant crystal of Benson Mines 310 orthoclase with an estimated spherical radius equal to that in the neon experiment. The <sup>39</sup>Ar 311 312 experiment appears to comprise a single linear Arrhenius array (Fig. 3A). There is a slight downward deviation in diffusivity between 50 and 70% of the cumulative <sup>39</sup>Ar released as well 313 314 (Fig. 3C). However, the steps following this downward deviation occur at temperatures exceeding 1100 °C (Fig. 3B), at which point the crystal used in the <sup>39</sup>Ar experiment is melting 315 316 (Schairer, 1950; Parsons, 2010). The two labradorite samples studied from Surtsey, Iceland and Plush, Oregon, both exhibit upward deviations from linear Arrhenius behavior in <sup>37</sup>Ar stepwise 317 318 degassing experiments at temperatures between 600 and 800 °C and at gas release fractions < 10% (Figs. 4 and 5; Cassata and Renne, 2013). Essentially all of the <sup>21</sup>Ne in our stepwise 319 320 degassing experiment on Surtsey labradorite was released during steps below 600 °C (Fig. 4C) and comprises a single linear Arrhenius array (Fig. 4A). The <sup>21</sup>Ne step degassing experiment on 321 322 Plush labradorite, on the other hand, shows a significant downward deviation from an initial linear Arrhenius array at 350 °C and 25% of the cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne released (Fig. 5). Lastly, we 323 324 compare neon and argon degassing experiments on two samples of anorthite, the calcium 325 endmember of plagioclase feldspar. In Grass Valley anorthite, neon and argon both show downward deviations from linear Arrhenius behavior, but at different temperatures and gas 326 327 release fractions (Fig. 6). Anorthite from lunar sample 76535 shows linear Arrhenius behavior for 97% of the <sup>21</sup>Ne measured but downward deviation from linear behavior at 30% of the 328

329 cumulative  ${}^{37}$ Ar and 1000 °C.

330

For the subset of each dataset comprising a linear Arrhenius array, we find that <sup>21</sup>Ne activation 331 332 energies range from 83.3 to 110.7 kJ/mol and apparent pre-exponential factors ( $D_0$ ) range from  $2.4 \times 10^{-3}$  to  $1.99 \times 10^{2}$  cm<sup>2</sup>s<sup>-1</sup>. These diffusion parameters are within the range of those 333 334 calculated by Gourbet et al. (2012) for three alkali feldspars. Activation energies and apparent pre-exponential factors for <sup>21</sup>Ne diffusion in plagioclase feldspars are generally greater than 335 336 those in alkali feldspars, although a larger number of neon stepwise degassing experiments are 337 necessary to determine if this trend is systematic. Roughly the opposite trend was observed for 338 the activation energy of argon diffusion as a function of composition (Cassata and Renne, 2013). 339

## 340 4. Discussion

341 While argon diffusion in feldspars has been studied at length over several decades, this is only 342 the second work to examine neon diffusion in feldspars and the first work to study neon diffusion 343 in plagioclase feldspars. As such, these neon stepwise degassing experiments provide insight into the potential noble gas diffusion mechanisms in feldspars. Below we discuss evidence for both 344 345 structural modifications and multiple diffusive lengthscales affecting noble gas diffusion in 346 feldspars. For feldspars that exhibit complex neon diffusion behavior, we construct multiple 347 diffusion domain (MDD) models. We use the diffusion parameters from these MDD models as 348 well as the diffusion parameters determined for feldspars exhibiting simple Arrhenius behavior 349 to explore the temperatures and exposure durations over which cosmogenic neon-in-feldspar 350 paleothermometry can be applied to study past surface temperatures.

### 352 4.1 Comparison of neon and argon diffusion

## 353 *4.1.1 Neon and argon diffusion in alkali feldspars*

Of the samples we examined, Fish Canyon and Gulf of Salerno sanidine exhibited the simplest 354 Arrhenius behavior for argon diffusion (Figs. 1 and 2; Cassata and Renne, 2013). A single linear 355 Arrhenius array characterizing all of the <sup>39</sup>Ar released during these experiments is consistent 356 357 with a single diffusion lengthscale, which we assume is equal the grain size analyzed (in which case a  $\approx$  213, 332, and 407 µm for Fish Canyon sanidine 1, Fish Canyon sanidine 2, and Gulf of 358 Salerno sanidine respectively, which we estimated from the total amount of <sup>39</sup>Ar, the duration of 359 360 the neutron irradiation, and the stoichiometry of each feldspar). Cassata and Renne (2013) also 361 attribute simple behavior to the fact that sanidine has monoclinic crystal symmetry at room 362 temperature and does not undergo a displacive transition during heating. Consequently, thermal 363 expansion proceeds linearly in all three unit cell directions (Brown et al., 1984; Hovis et al., 1999). Our proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne stepwise degassing experiments on Fish Canyon and Gulf of 364 365 Salerno sanidine also exhibit simple diffusion behavior, with  $\geq$  90% of the <sup>21</sup>Ne degassed 366 plotting on a single linear Arrhenius array and no additional arrays formed from the few high temperatures steps that deviate. The neutron-induced <sup>22</sup>Ne stepwise degassing experiment on 367 Fish Canyon sanidine reported by Gourbet et al. (2012) seemingly conflicts with our observation 368 of simple neon diffusion behavior (Fig. 1A). One possibility is that the crystal fragment used in 369 370 the neutron-irradiated experiment was fractured before or during the stepwise degassing 371 experiment. Another possibility is that heating to > 250 °C during neutron irradiation caused 372 some diffusive loss of neon. This latter possibility seems likely given the diffusion kinetics we 373 determined for Fish Canyon sanidine; however, we would expect the initial neon data from the 374 neutron-irradiated experiment to plot below the linear Arrhenius array in the proton-irradiated

experiment if this were the case. Gourbet et al. (2012) suggest that production of <sup>22</sup>Ne from the 375 spallation reaction  ${}^{23}$ Na(n,np) ${}^{22}$ Ne during neutron irradiation may have been spatially variable 376 due to core-to-rim zonation of Na in Fish Canyon sanidine (Bachmann et al., 2002). Spatially 377 variable <sup>22</sup>Ne production violates the assumption of a uniform initial <sup>22</sup>Ne distribution and could 378 lead to curved Arrhenius arrays. However, if spatially variable production of <sup>22</sup>Ne from <sup>23</sup>Na was 379 the cause of nonlinear behavior, we would expect to observe nonlinear behavior in the argon 380 experiments as well, given that <sup>39</sup>Ar is produced from <sup>39</sup>K and K is also zoned in Fish Canyon 381 sanidine (Bachmann et al., 2002). Curvature in the proton-irradiated neon experiments might 382 also be expected if this were the case, although spatially variable production from <sup>23</sup>Na would be 383 384 buffered by reactions on Al and Si with similar cross sections (Koning et al., 2015). Given these 385 numerous potential complications with the Fish Canyon sanidine experiment reported by 386 Gourbet et al. (2012), we suggest that our stepwise degassing experiments using proton-387 irradiated Fish Canyon sanidine more accurately characterize neon diffusion in that sample. Our <sup>21</sup>Ne results, when paired with the <sup>39</sup>Ar stepwise degassing experiments, strongly support the 388 389 case for these sanidine samples having a single diffusion domain with a single diffusion 390 lengthscale, which we assume is defined by the physical grain size. Additionally, the diffusion parameters ( $E_a$  and  $D_0$ ) for Fish Canyon and Gulf of Salerno sanidine are in good agreement with 391 one another for the respective noble gases examined. The diffusion parameters reported in Table 392 393 2 for Fish Canyon and Gulf of Salerno sanidine can therefore be straightforwardly compared to 394 theoretical calculations (e.g., density functional theory or molecular dynamics simulations) of interstitial neon and argon diffusion through the monoclinic sanidine crystal structure. 395 396



398 monoclinic orthoclase is also expected to undergo linear thermal expansion. Cassata and Renne 399 conducted five argon stepwise degassing experiments on Benson Mines orthoclase, one on an 400 equant fragment (Fig. 3) and four on sheet-like cleavage fragments (Fig. S2). All five experiments exhibit deviations from a linear Arrhenius array at high temperatures and <sup>39</sup>Ar 401 402 release fractions; however, in all experiments these deviations occur near the melting point of orthoclase (Schairer, 1950; Parsons, 2010), making it difficult to assess its origin. The <sup>21</sup>Ne 403 404 stepwise degassing experiment on Benson Mines orthoclase, on the other hand, shows a clear downward deviation from linear Arrhenius behavior beginning at 70% of the cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne 405 406 released and at 500 °C, hundreds of degrees below the melting temperature of orthoclase (Fig. 3). 407 There was no visible evidence for fracturing or other alteration when we unpacked the crystal for 408 X-Ray CT analysis, indicating that no change in the physical grain size occurred before or during 409 the experiment. Additionally, a second linear Arrhenius array observed at higher temperatures and gas release fractions in the <sup>21</sup>Ne experiment includes a retrograde heating cycle (Fig. 3A). If 410 411 nonlinear Arrhenius behavior resulted from a reversible, temperature-dependent structural 412 transformation, we would expect diffusivities in the retrograde heating to approach diffusivities 413 observed at the same temperatures in the preceding prograde heating, which was not observed. 414 These observations leave two potential explanations for the nonlinear Arrhenius behavior. It is 415 possible that the crystal of Benson Mines orthoclase we analyzed was fractured in a way that was 416 not detected by either optical microscopy or X-ray CT, in which case replicating the neon step 417 degassing experiment on a different crystal of Benson Mines orthoclase would result in different Arrhenius behavior. Alternatively, these results could indicate that nonlinear Arrhenius behavior 418 of <sup>21</sup>Ne reflects a preexisting material property (sub-grain domain distribution) of Benson Mines 419 420 orthoclase. This latter possibility suggests that the same intrinsic property of Benson Mines

421 orthoclase ought to cause nonlinear Arrhenius behavior for argon. Deviations from linearity 422 observed in argon experiments reported by Cassata and Renne (2013) occur between 15 and 80% 423 of the Ar released, which at first appears to suggest that sub-grain features defining the diffusion 424 lengthscale vary from grain to grain. However, these deviations all occur near the melting 425 temperature of orthoclase, making the origin of these deviations ambiguous. A straightforward test of this hypothesis would be to conduct another <sup>39</sup>Ar stepwise degassing experiment on 426 Benson Mines orthoclase with a revised heating schedule, such that all of the <sup>39</sup>Ar is released at 427 428 temperatures significantly below the orthoclase melting temperature.

429

### 430 *4.1.2 Neon and argon diffusion in plagioclase feldspars*

431 Our neon stepwise degassing experiments on plagioclase feldspars highlight how the effects of 432 both structural modification during laboratory heating and preexisting material properties can be 433 convoluted to result in nonlinear Arrhenius behavior. Cassata and Renne (2013) conducted a 434 number of experiments on labradorite samples, all of which exhibit upward deviations from initial linear Arrhenius arrays at temperatures between 600 and 800 °C. They argue that in 435 436 labradorite and other Ca-rich feldspars, upward deviations are the result of an increase in the rate 437 of thermal expansion above 600 °C, which has been observed experimentally (Tribaudino et al., 438 2010; Hovis et al., 2010). This interpretation is consistent with our neon stepwise degassing 439 experiments on Surtsey and Plush labradorite, as we observed no upward deviations from an initial Arrhenius array and degas > 99% of the  $^{21}$ Ne below 600 °C in both experiments (Figs. 4 440 and 5). However, in the case of Plush labradorite, we observe a downward deviation from an 441 initial linear Arrhenius array when ~25% of the <sup>21</sup>Ne had been released and at 350 °C (Fig. 5), a 442 443 temperature for which no changes in the rate of thermal expansion are expected. Like our neon

degassing experiment on Benson Mines orthoclase, retrograde heating steps in the Plush 444 445 labradorite experiment do not overlap with the initial linear Arrhenius array, confirming that this 446 behavior is not a result of a reversible structural change. If we assume that the crystal of Plush labradorite was not fractured, these results instead suggest that complex neon diffusion behavior 447 reflects a preexisting material property of Plush labradorite. A very small fraction (< 10%) of the 448 449 total gas is released below 600 °C in argon stepwise degassing experiments; therefore the effects 450 of this preexisting material property are likely obscured by the coincident changes in rate of 451 thermal expansion. Without the observation of temperature-independent complex Arrhenius 452 behavior from the neon stepwise degassing experiment on Plush labradorite, simple down-453 temperature extrapolation of the initial linear Arrhenius array in the argon stepwise degassing 454 experiment to geologically relevant temperatures may have seem justified. However, doing so would likely result in inaccurate thermal history reconstruction. In contrast to Plush labradorite, 455 with Surtsey labradorite we observe a single linear Arrhenius array for <sup>21</sup>Ne (Fig. 4), suggesting 456 457 this labradorite is characterized by a single diffusion domain with a single diffusion lengthscale, 458 which may be defined by the physical grain size (a  $\approx 307 \,\mu$ m). Furthermore, this implies that nonlinear behavior for Ar diffusion, manifest as upward curvature on Arrhenius plots at ~600 °C, 459 460 followed by downward curvature at higher temperatures, is likely related to structural 461 modifications of the feldspar in response to heating (Cassata and Renne, 2013). Accurate 462 geologic thermal history information could therefore be inferred for Surtsey labradorite by 463 downward extrapolation of initial linear Arrhenius arrays.

464

465 Unlike the other feldspars we studied, anorthite undergoes a structural transition during neon
466 stepwise degassing experiments. Between 225 and 300 °C, anorthite transitions from a *P1* to *T*

467 triclinic crystal symmetry (Smith and Ribbe, 1969; Van Tendeloo et al., 1989). The *P1–T* 468 transition is accompanied by an increase in unit cell volume and in the rate of thermal expansion 469 (Tribaudino et al., 2010), both of which ought to decrease the energy barrier to interstitial diffusion and increase noble gas diffusivities. Therefore we expect to observe upward deviations 470 471 from initial linear Arrhenius arrays associated with this transition in neon stepwise degassing 472 experiments but not in argon stepwise degassing experiments, as the latter take place at temperatures above the P1-T transition. In the <sup>21</sup>Ne stepwise degassing experiment on Grass 473 474 Valley anorthite, we observed the opposite: downward deviation from an initial linear Arrhenius 475 array occurred at 300 °C (Fig. 6). However, we do not find this surprising given the 476 crystallochemical complexity of Grass Valley anorthite, which is characterized by two phases of 477 anorthite separated by antiphase boundaries, as well large muscovite inclusions, plagioclase subgrains, and Na-rich feldspar alteration patches (McLaren and Marshall, 1974; Rainey and 478 479 Wenk, 1978). Thus we anticipate both the diffusion kinetics and initial distribution of neon to be 480 spatially variable in this sample. Given this heterogeneity, it is also expected that the argon and 481 neon diffusion experiments on different aliquots of Grass Valley anorthite are not reconcilable with one another. A neon stepwise degassing experiment on neutron-irradiated anorthite from 482 483 lunar sample 76535 (Garrick-Bethell et al., 2017) exhibits linear Arrhenius behavior between 484 170 and 800 °C for essentially all of the gas released (Fig. 7). There appears to be a slight 485 upward deviation in the diffusivities at  $\sim 300$  °C, which may be associated with the *P1–T* 486 transition. However, fitting a linear regression to only the data collected below 300 °C yields 487 indistinguishable diffusion parameters from those calculated using all the data. Linear Arrhenius 488 behavior at temperatures below 800 °C in the neon experiment is also consistent with the downward deviation from an initial linear Arrhenius array above 800 °C in the argon experiment 489

490 being caused by the transition to an *I1* symmetry (Megaw et al., 1962; Foit and Peacor, 1973).491

492 To summarize our comparison of neon and argon stepwise degassing experiments, we often see 493 different Arrhenius behavior for neon diffusion than was observed for argon diffusion in the 494 same feldspars. The origin of these differences depends on the feldspar in question. In several 495 cases, the effects of a preexisting material property of a particular feldspar and the effects of a 496 structural transformation during laboratory heating are conflated in argon stepwise degassing 497 experiments; neon stepwise degassing experiments conducted at lower temperatures make such 498 conflations apparent. It would be valuable to measure neon and argon isotopes simultaneously in 499 future stepwise degassing experiments on neutron-irradiated feldspars in order to discern 500 between such effects.

501

#### 502 4.2 Multiple diffusion domain (MDD) model for neon diffusion in feldspars

503 At present, we cannot ascribe a specific intrinsic property or mechanism to nonlinear Arrhenius 504 behavior that is not associated with a temperature-dependent structural transformation. 505 Identifying the origin of this complex Arrhenius behavior in argon stepwise degassing 506 experiments is critically important, because crystallochemical changes that could potentially be 507 responsible for this behavior (e.g., strain-induced microtextural development, fluid alteration) 508 may have occurred during the portion of a sample's geologic thermal history that is relevant to <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar thermochronometry. For cosmogenic noble gas thermochronometry using neon in 509 510 feldspars, wherein production and diffusion are only happening at planetary surfaces where 511 feldspars are exposed to cosmic ray particles, we expect any major crystallochemical changes to 512 have occurred at much higher temperatures than are relevant to the system of interest. In other

words, all crystallochemical heterogeneities are present throughout the thermal history recorded
by cosmogenic neon in feldspars, with the possible exception of those generated by shock during
impact events. Thus although we do not have a mechanistic explanation for the nonlinear,
temperature-independent Arrhenius behavior observed in some neon experiments, we think this
complex behavior characterizes cosmogenic neon diffusivity and therefore must be accounted for

518 to accurately reconstruct temperatures using cosmogenic neon in feldspars.

519

520 In order to account for complex neon diffusion in feldspars, we modeled the results of stepwise 521 degassing experiments exhibiting complex Arrhenius behavior using multiple diffusion domain (MDD) theory (Lovera and Richter, 1989; Lovera et al., 1991; Harrison et al., 1991). MDD 522 523 theory explains nonlinear Arrhenius behavior as the result of diffusion from multiple, non-524 interacting subgrain domains of varying sizes. Our modeling approach is similar to that described 525 in Tremblay et al. (2014b), wherein diffusivities are calculated for the experiment heating 526 schedule using the equations outlined by Fechtig and Kalbitzer (1966) for a spherical geometry 527 and for a given diffusion domain distribution. The number of subgrain domains was allowed to vary, and the models were designed to search over a large number of combinations of activation 528 energy ( $E_a$ ), pre-exponential factor( $D_0/a^2$ ), and gas fraction (f) attributed to each domain; 529 530 activation energy was held in common for all domains. For a particular number of diffusion 531 domains, we determined the combination of diffusion parameters and gas fractions that best 532 agreed with the stepwise degassing experiments by calculating a misfit statistic M:

533 
$$M = \sum_{j=1}^{n} |f_{p,j} - f_{m,j}|$$

where  $f_{p,j}$  is the modeled cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne released at heating step *j*,  $f_{p,j}$  is the observed

cumulative <sup>21</sup>Ne released at heating step *i*, and *n* is the total number of heating steps. This misfit 535 536 statistic is analogous to the reduced chi-squared misfit statistic used in Tremblay et al. (2014b) in 537 that the same set of diffusion parameters minimizes both quantities. However, the cumulative difference in predicted and observed gas fractions used here has more physical meaning. For 538 example, a misfit statistic of 0.15 can be thought of as not predicting 15% of the observed <sup>21</sup>Ne 539 540 released with our MDD model. We continued to add diffusion domains until the minimized 541 misfit statistic with x + 1 domains was within 0.03 of the minimized misfit statistic with x 542 domains. In Fig. 8, we show the best fit MDD models for the neon stepwise degassing 543 experiments on Benson Mines orthoclase, Plush labradorite, and Grass Valley anorthite; best fit diffusion parameters, gas fractions, and misfit statistics are reported in Table 3. By assuming that 544 545 this model framework can be extrapolated over time and to lower temperatures, we use the MDD model fits for these feldspars in the remaining discussion to assess the sensitivity of cosmogenic 546 547 neon-in-feldspar paleothermometry to exposure temperature and duration.

548

#### 549 4.3 Implications for neon retentivity in feldspars

550 The seven neon stepwise degassing experiments reported here, combined with the experiments 551 reported by Gourbet et al. (2012) and Tremblay and Shuster (2016), demonstrate that neon 552 diffusion kinetics and behavior vary widely amongst feldspars of different compositions and 553 geologic origins. This is perhaps not surprising, given the vast range of diffusion kinetics and 554 behavior observed in argon stepwise degassing experiments (e.g., Lovera et al., 1997; Lovera et 555 al., 2002; Cassata and Renne, 2013). Nonetheless, the variability of neon diffusion kinetics and 556 behavior has important implications for the applicability of laboratory-determined diffusion 557 kinetics to applications of cosmogenic neon paleothermometry (Tremblay et al., 2014a).

558 Specifically, these results indicate that sample-specific diffusion kinetics will be necessary to559 quantitatively reconstruct temperatures using cosmogenic neon in feldspars.

560

To illustrate this point, in Fig. 9 we show how cosmogenic neon retentivity will evolve as a 561 562 function of exposure duration for a constant exposure temperature of 20 °C using the different 563 diffusion parameters obtained in neon stepwise degassing experiments. Retentivity refers to the 564 amount of cosmogenic neon produced during exposure to cosmic ray particles that has not 565 diffused out of the feldspar; thus a retentivity of one indicates no diffusive loss, while a 566 retentivity asymptoting to zero indicates that steady steady state between production and diffusion has occurred. For feldspars exhibiting linear Arrhenius behavior, we assume that the 567 physical grain size defines the diffusion lengthscale of a single diffusion domain and scale 568 569 diffusivities to a common diffusion lengthscale of 500 µm; retention curves for these feldspars 570 are shown in Fig. 9A. Having normalized the diffusion lengthscale, we can see in Fig. 9A that 571 differences in diffusion parameters ( $E_a$  and  $D_0$ ) amongst different feldspars results in significant 572 variability in retentivity. For example, while lunar 76535 anorthite is expected to retain all of its 573 cosmogenic neon over 10 Ma of exposure at 20 °C, Easy Chair Crater anorthoclase would retain 574 < 10% given the same exposure history. In cases where we used MDD models to infer neon diffusion parameters, we do not know the diffusion lengthscale of the different domains as this 575 576 cannot be separated from the preexponential factor  $D_0$  without making additional assumptions. 577 Furthermore, it is likely that the domain size distributions in feldspars exhibiting MDD-like 578 behavior would depend on macroscopic grain size in a way that we cannot quantify. We 579 therefore did the calculations in Fig. 9B using the spherically equivalent radius of each feldspar 580 crystal analyzed in the stepwise degassing experiment. Fig. 9B highlights the difference in

cosmogenic neon retentivities that would be expected for simple extrapolation of initial linear
Arrhenius arrays versus MMD model calculated diffusion parameters in feldspars exhibiting
complex Arrhenius behavior. For some feldspars such as Benson Mines orthoclase, the
differences are small until very long exposure durations are reached (> 1 Ma); for others such as
Grass Valley anorthite, the differences become important on much shorter timescales (> 0.01
Ma).

587

588 In previous theoretical calculations on the sensitivity of cosmogenic neon-in-feldspar 589 paleothermometry (Tremblay et al., 2014a), we used the diffusion kinetics for Madagascar 590 cryptoperthite reported by Gourbet et al. (2012). However as can be seen in Fig. 9, we predict 591 lower cosmogenic neon retentivity using neon diffusion kinetics from most of the feldspars we 592 examined than when using Madagascar cryptoperthite kinetics. This means that the applicability 593 of cosmogenic noble gas paleothermometry to geologic problems will vary depending on the 594 specific feldspar and surface temperature environment. For example, Kober et al. (2005) measured cosmogenic <sup>21</sup>Ne abundances in sanidine from a welded tuff in the Atacama Desert 595 that were indistinguishable from what would be expected given theoretical <sup>21</sup>Ne production rates 596 597 for sanidine and the known exposure duration, suggesting that no diffusive loss of cosmogenic <sup>21</sup>Ne occurred. Complete cosmogenic <sup>21</sup>Ne retention suggests that the sanidine studied by Kober 598 599 et al. (2005) is significantly more retentive to neon than the two sanidine samples we conducted 600 stepwise degassing experiments on here, especially given the high amplitude temperature variations and peak temperatures that rocks experience in extreme environments like the 601 602 Atacama Desert (McKay et al., 2003; McFadden et al., 2005). Similarly, the lunar surface 603 experiences extreme variations in temperature during a lunar day cycle, with peak temperatures

604 in excess of 100 °C and temperature minima less than –150 °C (Keihm and Langseth, 1973).

However, because lunar 76535 anorthite is so retentive, Tremblay and Shuster (2016) were able

to measure cosmogenic neon abundances in multiple anorthite grains and calculate an accurate

607 estimate of the effective lunar surface temperature ( $75.5 \pm 4.2 \text{ °C}$ ) over the 142 Ma exposure

history of sample 76535. For any of the diffusion parameters we obtained for the other feldspars,

609 we would predict substantially lower and incorrect effect lunar surface temperatures.

610

## 611 **5. Conclusions**

612 We present stepwise neon degassing experiments on feldspars of various compositions and 613 geologic origins. This suite of experiments reveals that neon diffusion behavior and kinetics vary 614 significantly amongst different feldspars. Comparison with argon stepwise degassing 615 experiments on the same feldspars provides insight into the source of complex noble gas 616 diffusion behavior. For some feldspars, the absence of nonlinear Arrhenius behavior in neon 617 experiments conducted at lower temperatures suggests that the nonlinear behavior observed in 618 argon experiments resulted from temperature-dependent structural transformations. For other 619 feldspars, nonlinear Arrhenius behavior observed in both neon and argon experiments suggests 620 that some sample-specific material property is contributing to complex diffusion behavior. When 621 extrapolated down to planetary surface temperatures, the set of available neon diffusion kinetics 622 predicts a wide range of temperatures and exposure durations over which cosmogenic noble gas 623 paleothermometry may be applicable. This wide range indicates that (1) sample specific 624 diffusion kinetics will be necessary for quantitative applications, and (2) the temperature 625 sensitivity of cosmogenic noble gas paleothermometry will depend greatly on a combination of 626 the specific feldspar and surface thermal environment of interest.

# 628 Acknowledgements

- 629 We thank R. Wenk and D. Mark for providing samples. We also thank N. Fylstra, T. Becker, and
- 630 J. Maisano for analytical assistance. AE Greg Herzog and three reviewers provided constructive
- 631 feedback that strengthened this work. We acknowledge support from the NSF Petrology and
- 632 Geochemistry Program (EAR-1322086), the UC Berkeley Larsen Grant, and the Ann and
- 633 Gordon Getty Foundation. MMT was supported by an NSF Graduate Research Fellowship.
- 634

## 635 References Cited

- Bachmann O., Dungan M. A. and Lipman P. W. (2002) The Fish Canyon Magma Body, San
  Juan Volcanic Field, Colorado: Rejuvenation and Eruption of an Upper-Crustal Batholith. J. *Petrol.* 43, 1469–1503.
- Balco G. and Shuster D. L. (2009) Production rate of cosmogenic <sup>21</sup>Ne in quartz estimated from <sup>10</sup>Be, <sup>26</sup>Al, and <sup>21</sup>Ne concentrations in slowly eroding Antarctic bedrock surfaces. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 281, 48–58.
- Berger G. W. and York D. (1981) Geothermometry from <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar dating experiments.
   *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 45, 795–811.
- Brown W. L., Openshaw R. E., McMillan P. F. and Henderson M. B. (1984) A review of the
  expansion behavior of alkali feldspars: coupled variations in cell parameters and possible
  phase transitions. *American Mineralogist* 69, 1058–1071.
- Cassata W. S. and Renne P. R. (2013) Systematic variations of argon diffusion in feldspars and
   implications for thermochronometry. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 112, 251–287.
- Cassata W. S., Shuster D. L., Renne P. R. and Weiss B. P. (2010) Evidence for shock heating
   and constraints on Martian surface temperatures revealed by <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar thermochronometry
   of Martian meteorites. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 74, 6900–6920.
- 652 Crank J. (1975) The Mathematics of Diffusion., Oxford University Press, London.
- Evernden J. F., Curtis G. H., Kistler R. W. and Obradovich J. D. (1960) Argon diffusion in
  glauconite, microcline, sanidine, leucite and phlogopite. *Am. J. Sci.* 258, 583–604.
- Fechtig H., Gentner W. and Zähringer J. (1960) Argonbestimmungen an Kaliummineralien—VII
   Diffusionsverluste von Argon in Mineralien und ihre Auswirkung auf die Kalium-Argon Altersbestimmung. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 19, 70–79.

- Fechtig H. and Kalbitzer S. (1966) The Diffusion of Argon in Potassium-Bearing Solids. In
   *Potassium Argon Dating* pp. 68–107.
- Foit F. F. Jr. and Peacor D. R. (1973) The Anorthite Crystal Structure at 410 and 830 °C.
   *American Mineralogist* 58, 665–675.
- Foland K. A. and Xu Y. (1990) Diffusion of <sup>40</sup>Ar and <sup>39</sup>Ar in irradiated orthoclase. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 54, 3147–3158.
- Garrick-Bethell, I., Weiss, B.P., Shuster, D.L., Tikoo, S.M., Tremblay, M.M., 2017. Further
   evidence for early lunar magnetism from troctolite 76535. Journal of Geophysical Research:
   Planets.
- Gautheron C. and Tassan-Got L. (2010) A Monte Carlo approach to diffusion applied to noble
   gas/helium thermochronology. *Chem. Geol.* 273, 212–224.
- Gerling E. K., Levski L. K. and Morozova I. M. (1963) On the diffusion of radiogenic argon
  from minerals. *Geokhimiya* Vol: No. 6. Available at:
- 671 http://www.osti.gov/scitech/biblio/4712579.
- Gourbet L., Shuster D. L., Balco G., Cassata W. S., Renne P. R. and Rood D. (2012) Neon
  diffusion kinetics in olivine, pyroxene and feldspar: Retentivity of cosmogenic and
  nucleogenic neon. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 86, 21–36.
- Harrison T. M., Lovera O. M. and Matthew T. H. (1991) <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar results for alkali feldspars
   containing diffusion domains with differing activation energy. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 55, 1435–1448.
- Harrison T. M. and McDougall I. (1982) The thermal significance of potassium feldspar K-Ar ages inferred from <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar age spectrum results. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 46, 1811–
   1820.
- Herman F., Seward D., Valla P. G., Carter A., Kohn B., Willett S. D. and Ehlers T. A. (2013)
  Worldwide acceleration of mountain erosion under a cooling climate. *Nature* 504, 423–426.
- Hodges K. V., Ruhl K. W., Wobus C. W. and Pringle M. S. (2005) <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar Thermochronology
   of Detrital Minerals. *Rev. Mineral. Geochem.* 58, 239–257.
- Hovis G. L., Brennan S., Keohane M. and Crelling J. (1999) High-Temperature X-ray
  investigation of sanidine analbite crystalline solutions: thermal expansion, phase
  transitions, and volumes of mixing. *The Canadian Mineralogist* 37, 701–709.
- Hovis G. L., Medford A., Conlon M., Tether A. and Romanoski A. (2010) Principles of thermal
  expansion in the feldspar system. *Am. Mineral.* 95, 1060–1068.
- Huber C., Cassata W. S. and Renne P. R. (2011) A lattice Boltzmann model for noble gas
  diffusion in solids: The importance of domain shape and diffusive anisotropy and
  implications for thermochronometry. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 75, 2170–2186.

- Jourdan F., Moynier F., Koeberl C. and Eroglu S. (2011) <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar age of the Lonar crater and consequence for the geochronology of planetary impacts. *Geology* 39, 671–674.
- Keihm S. J. and Langseth M. G. Jr (1973) Surface brightness temperatures at the Apollo 17 heat
  flow site: Thermal conductivity of the upper 15 cm of regolith. In *Lunar and Planetary Science Conference Proceedings* adsabs.harvard.edu. p. 2503.
- Ketcham R. A. (2005) Computational methods for quantitative analysis of three-dimensional
   features in geological specimens. *Geosphere* 1, 32–41.
- Ketcham R. A. and Carlson W. D. (2001) Acquisition, optimization and interpretation of X-ray
   computed tomographic imagery: applications to the geosciences. *Comput. Geosci.* 27, 381–
   400.
- Kober F., Ivy-Ochs S., Leya I., Baur H., Magna T., Wieler R. and Kubik P. W. (2005) In situ
  cosmogenic 10Be and 21Ne in sanidine and in situ cosmogenic 3He in Fe–Ti-oxide
  minerals. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 236, 404–418.
- Koning A. J., Rochman D., Kopecky J., Ch. Sublet J., Bauge E., Hilaire S., Romain P., Morillon
  B., Duarte H., van der Marck S., Pomp S., Sjostrand H., Forrest R., Henriksson H., Cabellos
  O., Goriely S., Leppanen J., Leeb H., Plompen A. and Mills R. (2015) TENDL-2015. *TENDL-2015: TALYS-based evaluated nuclear data library*. Available at:
  https://tendl.web.psi.ch/tendl 2015/tendl2015.html.
- Lovera O. M., Grove M. and Harrison T. M. (2002) Systematic analysis of K-feldspar <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar
   step heating results II: relevance of laboratory argon diffusion properties to nature.
   *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 66, 1237–1255.
- Lovera O. M., Grove M., Harrison T.M., and Mahon K. I. (1997) Systematic analysis of K feldspar <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar step heating results: I. Significance of activation energy determinations.
   *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 61, 3171–3192.
- Lovera O. M., Harrison T. M. and Boehnke P. (2015) Comment on "Systematic variations of argon diffusion in feldspars and implications for thermochronometry" by Cassata and Renne. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 151, 168–171.
- Lovera O. M., Heizler M. T. and Harrison T.M. (1993) Argon diffusion domains in K-feldspar
  II: kinetic properties of MH-10. *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* 113, 381–393.
- Lovera O. M. and Richter F. M. (1989) The <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar Thermochronometry for Slowly Cooled
   Samples. J. Geophys. Res. 94, 17–917.
- Lovera O. M., Richter F. M. and Harrison T. M. (1991) Diffusion domains determined by <sup>39</sup>Ar
   released during step heating. J. Geophys. Res. 96, 2057–2069.
- McFadden L. D., Eppes M. C., Gillespie A. R. and Hallet B. (2005) Physical weathering in arid
   landscapes due to diurnal variation in the direction of solar heating. *GSA Bulletin* 117, 161–
   173.

- McKay C. P., Friedmann E. I., Gómez-Silva B., Cáceres-Villanueva L., Andersen D. T. and Landheim R. (2003) Temperature and moisture conditions for life in the extreme arid region of the Atacama desert: four years of observations including the El Niño of 1997-1998. *Astrobiology* 3, 393–406.
- McLaren A. C. and Marshall D. B. (1974) Transmission electron microscope study of the
   domain structures associated with the b-, c-, d-, e- and f-reflections in plagioclase feldspars.
   *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* 44, 237–249.
- McLaren S., Dunlap W. J. and Powell R. (2007) Understanding K-feldspar <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar data:
   reconciling models, methods and microtextures. J. Geol. Soc. London 164, 941–944.
- Meesters A. G. C. A. and Dunai T. J. (2002) Solving the production–diffusion equation for finite
  diffusion domains of various shapes: Part I. Implications for low-temperature (U–Th)/He
  thermochronology. *Chem. Geol.* 186, 333–344.
- Megaw H. D., Kempster C. J. E. and Radoslovich E. W. (1962) The structure of anorthite,
   CaAl<sub>2</sub>Si<sub>2</sub>O<sub>8</sub> II. Description and discussion. *Acta Crystallogr.* 15, 1017–1035.
- Min K., Reiners P. W., Nicolescu S. and Greenwood J. P. (2004) Age and temperature of shock
   metamorphism of Martian meteorite Los Angeles from (U-Th)/He thermochronometry.
   *Geology* 32, 677.
- Parsons I. (2010) Feldspars defined and described: a pair of posters published by the
   Mineralogical Society. Sources and supporting information. *Mineral. Mag.* 74, 529–551.
- Parsons I., Brown W. L. and Smith J. V. (1999) <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar thermochronology using alkali
   feldspars: real thermal history or mathematical mirage of microtexture? *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* 136, 92–110.
- Rainey C. S. and Wenk H.-R. (1978) Intensity differences of subsidiary reflections in calcic
   plagioclase. *American Mineralogist* 63, 124–131.
- Reynolds J. H. (1957) Comparative study of argon content and argon diffusion in mica and
   feldspar. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 12, 177–184.
- Richter F. M., Lovera O. M., Harrison T. M. and Copeland P. (1991) Tibetan tectonics from
   <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar analysis of a single K-feldspar sample. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 105, 266–278.
- Schairer J. F. (1950) The Alkali-Feldspar Join in the System NaAlSiO<sub>4</sub>-KAlSiO<sub>2</sub>. J. Geol.
  58, 512–517.
- Shuster D. L., Balco G., Cassata W. S., Fernandes V. A., Garrick-Bethell I. and Weiss B. P.
  (2010) A record of impacts preserved in the lunar regolith. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 290, 155–165.
- Shuster D. L. and Cassata W. S. (2015) Paleotemperatures at the lunar surfaces from open
   system behavior of cosmogenic <sup>38</sup>Ar and radiogenic <sup>40</sup>Ar. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 155,

- 764 154–171.
- Shuster D. L. and Farley K. A. (2005a) <sup>4</sup>He/<sup>3</sup>He Thermochronometry: Theory, Practice, and
   Potential Complications. Rev. Mineral. Geochem. 58, 181–203.
- Shuster D. L. and Farley K. A. (2005b) Diffusion kinetics of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne, <sup>3</sup>He, and <sup>4</sup>He in quartz. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 69, 2349–2359.
- Shuster D. L. and Farley K. A. (2009) The influence of artificial radiation damage and thermal
   annealing on helium diffusion kinetics in apatite. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 73, 183–196.
- Shuster D. L., Farley K. A., Sisterson J. M. and Burnett D. S. (2004) Quantifying the diffusion kinetics and spatial distributions of radiogenic <sup>4</sup>He in minerals containing proton-induced <sup>3</sup>He. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 217, 19–32.
- Smith J. V. and Ribbe P. H. (1969) Atomic movements in plagioclase feldspars: Kinetic
   interpretation. *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* 21, 157–202.
- Tremblay M. M., Shuster D. L. and Balco G. (2014a) Cosmogenic noble gas paleothermometry.
   *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 400, 195–205.
- Tremblay M. M., Shuster D. L. and Balco G. (2014b) Diffusion kinetics of <sup>3</sup>He and <sup>21</sup>Ne in quartz and implications for cosmogenic noble gas paleothermometry. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* 142, 186–204.
- Tribaudino M., Angel R. J., Cámara F., Nestola F., Pasqual D. and Margiolaki I. (2010) Thermal
   expansion of plagioclase feldspars. *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* 160, 899–908.
- Turner G. (1971)<sup>40</sup>Ar-<sup>39</sup>Ar ages from the lunar maria. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **11**, 169–191.
- Van Tendeloo G., Ghose S. and Amelinckx S. (1989) A dynamical model for the P1—I1 phase
   transition in anorthite, CaAl<sub>2</sub>Si<sub>2</sub>O<sub>8</sub>. *Phys. Chem. Miner.* 16, 311–319.
- Villa I. M. (2006) From nanometer to megameter: Isotopes, atomic-scale processes, and continent-scale tectonic models. *Lithos* 87, 155–173.
- Villa I. M. and Hanchar J. M. (2013) K-feldspar hygrochronology. *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*101, 24–33.
- Wolf R. A., Farley K. A. and Kass D. M. (1998) Modeling of the temperature sensitivity of the apatite (U–Th)/He thermochronometer. *Chem. Geol.* 148, 105–114.
- Ziegler J. F., Ziegler M. D. and Biersack J. P. (2010/6) SRIM The stopping and range of ions
   in matter (2010). Nucl. Instrum. Methods Phys. Res. B 268, 1818–1823.

# 794 Tables

Sampla	Description	Dhaga	Composition		
Sample	Description	Flase	An	Ab	Or
BMk	Granitic pegmatite, Benson Mines, NY USA	Orthoclase	0.0	3.0	97.0
FCs	Rhyolitic ignimbrite, Fish Canyon Tuff, CO USA	Sanidine	1.0	27.0	72.0
GSs	Rhyolitic ash, Gulf of Salerno, Italy	Sanidine	3.7	30.5	65.8
SURTp	Basaltic lava, Surtsey, Iceland	Labradorite	59.6	39.6	0.8
OREGp	Basaltic lava, Plush, OR USA	Labradorite	63.9	35.4	0.7
GV-09	Anorthosite, Grass Valley, CA USA	Anorthite	94.2	5.2	0.6
76535	Troctolite, Moon	Anorthite	96.2	3.5	0.3

**Table 1.** Description of feldspar samples studied in diffusion experiments.

796

\_

**Table 2.** Summary of neon diffusion parameters. 1σ uncertainties are reported.

Sample	Spherical equiv. radius (μm) <sup>a</sup>	E <sub>a</sub> (kJ/mol)	±	$\ln(D_0/a^2)$	±	Apparent $D_{\theta} (\text{cm}^2/\text{s})^{\text{b}}$
BMk-D	283, 271	91.7	2.1	4.32	0.44	5.52E-02
FCs-A	308, 276	83.6	1.8	1.14	0.34	2.38E-03
FCs-C	327, 328	86.3	1.4	1.90	0.24	7.19E-03
GSs-A	178, 205	83.3	1.5	3.88	0.32	2.04E-02
SURTp-B	307	94.3	1.2	4.72	0.24	1.06E-01
OREGp-A	320, 336	102.1	1.9	6.28	0.46	6.03E-01
GV-09-A	230	103.3	3.5	12.84	0.89	1.99E+02
76535-B <sup>c</sup>	296, 244	110.7	1.6	0.73	0.32	8.86E-01

<sup>a</sup>Spherically equivalent radii were calculated in several different ways. In the first instance, the radius was calculated from the surface area to volume ratio (SA/V) of the crystal analzyed using optical microscope measurements. For some of the <sup>21</sup>Ne stepwise degassing experiments, a second radius is listed that was calculated from the SA/V determined from X-ray computed tomography measurements (Table S2).

<sup>b</sup>Calculated assuming the spherically equivalent radius of the crystals analyzed defines a, the diffusive lengthscale.

<sup>c</sup>Stepwise degassing experiment data presented in Tremblay and Shuster (2016).

798

Sample	Domain	$E_a$ (kJ/mol)	$\ln(D_{\theta}/a^2)$	f	Misfit
BMk-D	1	91.5	4.0	0.45	0.17
	2		5.6	0.30	
	3		1.2	0.25	
OREGp-A	1	96.9	2.4	0.74	0.16
	2		7.4	0.26	
GV-09-A	1	108.4	14.9	0.76	0.33
	2		19.2	0.08	
	3		8.0	0.08	
	4		4.3	0.08	

**Table 3.** Best fit multiple diffusion domain model parameters.



804

Fig. 1. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green), 805 neutron-induced <sup>39</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013), and neutron-induced <sup>22</sup>Ne 806 807 (purple; data from Gourbet et al., 2012) in different crystals of Fish Canyon sanidine. For visual clarity, residuals are not shown for neutron-induced <sup>22</sup>Ne.  $D/a^2$  values are normalized to s<sup>-1</sup>. 808 Uncertainties in  $\ln(D/a^2)$  estimated using a Monte Carlo approach (Tremblay et al., 2014b) are 809 810 shown, although in most cases the uncertainty is smaller than the symbol plotted. Linear regressions in (A) are fit through the filled symbols and used to determine  $E_a$  and  $\ln(D_0/a^2)$ , 811 812 assuming an Arrhenian dependence of diffusivity on temperature (Eq. 1). Residuals, defined as the difference between the calculated  $\ln(D/a^2)$  from a given heating step and the expected 813  $\ln(D/a^2)$  from the linear regression at the same temperature, are plotted against temperature (B) 814 815 and cumulative gas release fraction (C). Filled symbols are the same as in (A).



Fig. 2. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green)
and neutron-induced <sup>39</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013) in different crystals of Gulf
of Salerno sanidine. Units, uncertainties, linear regressions, and residuals are as described for
Fig. 1.



Fig. 3. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green)
and neutron-induced <sup>39</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013) in different crystals of
Benson Mines orthoclase. Units, uncertainties, linear regressions, and residuals are as described
for Fig. 1.



Fig. 4. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green)
and neutron-induced <sup>37</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013) in different crystals of
Surtsey, Iceland labradorite. Units, uncertainties, linear regressions, and residuals are as
described for Fig. 1.



Fig. 5. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green)
and neutron-induced <sup>37</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013) in different crystals of
Plush, Oregon labradorite. Units, uncertainties, linear regressions, and residuals are as described
for Fig. 1.



Fig. 6. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of proton-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green)
and neutron-induced <sup>37</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013) in different crystals of
Grass Valley anorthite. Units, uncertainties, linear regressions, and residuals are as described for
Fig. 1.



Fig. 7. Arrhenius plot (A) and residual plots (B-C) for diffusion of neutron-induced <sup>21</sup>Ne (green;
data from Garrick-Bethell et al., 2017) and <sup>39</sup>Ar (blue; data from Cassata and Renne, 2013) in
different crystals of lunar 76535 anorthite. Units, uncertainties, linear regressions, and residuals
are as described for Fig. 1.



Fig. 8. Arrhenius plots comparing calculated diffusivities from multiple diffusion domain
(MDD) models (black) to calculated diffusivities from neon stepwise degassing experiments
(green) for Benson Mines orthoclase (A), Plush labradorite (B), and Grass Valley anorthite (C).
Lines correspond to diffusion parameters characterizing each diffusion domain, which are listed
in Table 3 along with the fraction of gas comprising each domain and the misfit statistic of the
models shown.



857 Fig. 9. Demonstration of the variability of neon retentivity in feldspars. Using the neon diffusion parameters reported here and elsewhere (Gourbet et al., 2012; Garrick-Bethell et al., 2017), we 858 calculate how neon retention evolves as a function of exposure duration assuming a constant 859 860 exposure temperature of 20 °C after Wolf et al. (1998). In (A), we show neon retention curves 861 for the six feldspars that exhibit relatively simple linear Arrhenius behavior. Simple linear 862 Arrhenius behavior suggests that the physical grain size defines the diffusion lengthscale for 863 these feldspars; therefore we normalized the diffusion lengthscale to a common spherically equivalent radius of 500 µm. In (B), we show neon retention curves for exhibiting complex 864 Arrhenius behavior using diffusion parameters calculated both from the initial linear Arrhenius 865 866 array (solid curves) observed in stepwise degassing experiments as well as using an MDD model (dashed curves). As discussed in the text, we use the grain size analyzed in the stepwise 867 868 degassing experiment for these calculations, as there is no straightforward way to normalize the 869 diffusion lengthscale for feldspars exhibiting complex diffusion behavior.