

1
00:00:07,014 --> 00:00:08,458
I was really keen to find out,

2
00:00:08,543 --> 00:00:10,068
Iâ€™d heard so much about
how Paris have been doing

3
00:00:10,350 --> 00:00:14,018
a fabulous job with participatory
budgeting across Europe,

4
00:00:14,360 --> 00:00:17,490
they were the ones who were
doing it on such a huge scale.

5
00:00:17,951 --> 00:00:19,206
So, I was fascinated to see

6
00:00:19,473 --> 00:00:20,257
how they made it work,

7
00:00:20,677 --> 00:00:23,287
but more specifically to look
at how they engaged

8
00:00:23,538 --> 00:00:25,090
some of the more marginalised communities,

9
00:00:25,859 --> 00:00:27,378
how they were maybe measuring the success,

10
00:00:28,250 --> 00:00:31,639
what the impacts were,
and obviously some of the technology

11
00:00:32,052 --> 00:00:35,553
behind doing something across
such a huge city like Paris.

12
00:00:46,942 --> 00:00:49,345
My expectation was to see

what worked in Paris

13

00:00:50,187 --> 00:00:54,973

and how could that be perhaps lifted
and used in Scotland as such, be used in Fife.

14

00:00:55,445 --> 00:00:56,752

Was there some comparisons
that we did in Paris

15

00:00:57,514 --> 00:00:59,395

that we could say that would work in Fife?

16

00:00:59,844 --> 00:01:02,305

So, I think it was about
compare and contrast for me.

17

00:01:02,772 --> 00:01:05,829

I think the aim of this trip
was people came to Paris

18

00:01:06,194 --> 00:01:07,651

and learnt what Paris had done,

19

00:01:08,014 --> 00:01:11,835

thereâ€™s a lot of similarities
between Paris and Glasgow,

20

00:01:12,494 --> 00:01:14,150

because it was Glasgow that chose the site,

21

00:01:14,788 --> 00:01:16,864

and we just thought it was
an ideal opportunity

22

00:01:17,196 --> 00:01:20,983

for people to learn from a city
that's gone further down the road

23

00:01:21,605 --> 00:01:22,969

than we have so far.

24

00:01:23,504 --> 00:01:26,106
Yes, we wanted to know at scale
how they delivered at scale,

25
00:01:26,555 --> 00:01:27,877
in terms of the 100 million,

26
00:01:28,077 --> 00:01:31,117
how did they structure
their departments around that

27
00:01:31,377 --> 00:01:33,960
and how that worked in terms of capacity.

28
00:01:34,851 --> 00:01:40,108
The first is the submission period,
so in 2017 it would go from

29
00:01:40,523 --> 00:01:42,711
21st of January to 21st of February.

30
00:01:43,223 --> 00:01:49,081
Then from March to May we do two things,
two different things.

31
00:01:49,776 --> 00:01:52,528
The first one is that
we analyse projects,

32
00:01:53,311 --> 00:01:56,133
the meeting of criterias
and if they are feasible,

33
00:01:57,285 --> 00:02:00,127
and the second thing we are
co-building projects this year,

34
00:02:01,286 --> 00:02:10,050
Last year, in 2016, we got 3200 projects
so it was too much...

35
00:02:11,170 --> 00:02:16,822
so we tried to put them together

on a topic basis, on a geographic basis,

36

00:02:17,947 --> 00:02:23,459

so that we can decrease the number
and make the vote easier.

37

00:02:24,154 --> 00:02:27,624

Because I thought the input
Ari gave, gave that overview,

38

00:02:28,608 --> 00:02:31,102

it gave the kind of the context to

39

00:02:32,078 --> 00:02:37,466

some of the kind of thinking behind it
and the overview of the application.

40

00:02:37,972 --> 00:02:40,121

The other meetings then added to that
and you could get a bit more

41

00:02:40,711 --> 00:02:45,824

from it or you could use the information you got
at the beginning to ask more in-depth questions.

42

00:02:46,236 --> 00:02:51,167

But, I felt that, that was really, really, useful
in being able to provide that oversight.

43

00:02:51,831 --> 00:02:55,010

PB in Paris is based around
their capital budget,

44

00:02:55,578 --> 00:02:56,976

so obviously we have
a capital programme

45

00:02:57,388 --> 00:03:01,106

and we're not currently using PB
in relation to that.

46

00:03:01,648 --> 00:03:05,003

I think the other thing is

around the incentives

47

00:03:05,315 --> 00:03:08,647
for people to get involved in PB,
so you can see it's very attractive

48

00:03:09,042 --> 00:03:11,437
for the arrondissement that
they could bring in

49

00:03:11,732 --> 00:03:15,288
an additional two Euros
for every Euro of budget.

50

00:03:17,857 --> 00:03:21,032
So, I found that interesting as
a lever and as an incentive

51

00:03:21,858 --> 00:03:27,069
to make the links between
strategic and local level.

52

00:03:27,673 --> 00:03:30,144
I think participatory budgeting
needs political will,

53

00:03:30,579 --> 00:03:33,253
and I think that was just reaffirmed
for me when I was in Paris.

54

00:03:33,642 --> 00:03:35,510
I could see the districts where
it worked well

55

00:03:35,742 --> 00:03:37,777
was because there was good
political will to make it happen

56

00:03:38,151 --> 00:03:40,099
and I could see the districts
where it didn't work well,

57

00:03:40,657 --> 00:03:43,068

was because maybe the local Mayor
wasn't interested or so forth.

58

00:03:44,488 --> 00:03:45,592

That's interesting,
because I think about Fife,

59

00:03:45,980 --> 00:03:48,060

would that work in the
same way that in seven areas,

60

00:03:48,210 --> 00:03:50,786

it might work well if you've got
local politicians interested,

61

00:03:51,195 --> 00:03:52,861

but if they're not,
would they just

62

00:03:52,963 --> 00:03:53,991

let it drop for something else?

63

00:03:54,635 --> 00:03:56,276

So, a lot to reflect on there I think.

64

00:04:06,045 --> 00:04:08,158

And, I'm not sure if Paris started small,

65

00:04:08,532 --> 00:04:09,534

I think they went for a big bang

66

00:04:10,181 --> 00:04:12,499

and I couldn't believe that they did
all that in three months,

67

00:04:13,886 --> 00:04:16,729

so yes, it was very useful.

68

00:04:17,306 --> 00:04:21,626

Then if you could click on one project,
a specific project,

69

00:04:22,054 --> 00:04:25,285
then you have, here, you have
the internal comments,

70
00:04:25,985 --> 00:04:29,491
so everything in the direction,
who is leading the project

71
00:04:30,134 --> 00:04:32,365
is put on for us to see and
for other directions to see.

72
00:04:33,310 --> 00:04:34,970
So, everyone is working on the same tool

73
00:04:35,788 --> 00:04:37,239
and itâ€™s a way to communicate also,

74
00:04:37,789 --> 00:04:40,566
so that every time you change
something about the project

75
00:04:40,981 --> 00:04:42,830
or anyone changes something

76
00:04:43,314 --> 00:04:45,827
they put it on here so
that there is no error.

77
00:04:46,388 --> 00:04:50,491
Going through quite a significant journey,
the front end, the back end.

78
00:04:51,080 --> 00:04:54,505
Also about the number of votes that take place,
the kind of interface

79
00:04:54,891 --> 00:04:56,453
between the Smartphones, the iPads,

80
00:04:57,360 --> 00:04:59,679
and the fact that you've got
a significant variation

81
00:04:59,940 --> 00:05:01,735
between the number of votes
that take place through

82
00:05:01,846 --> 00:05:04,305
the digitalisation, the paper vote and

83
00:05:04,446 --> 00:05:06,858
the kind of mobile aspect of it as well.

84
00:05:07,331 --> 00:05:10,342
I'm quite keen to see more
digitalisation of it in Scotland

85
00:05:10,813 --> 00:05:12,277
and I think Iâ€™ll take
a lot back from that.

86
00:05:12,555 --> 00:05:15,954
I think it's remarkable that they were able
to respond to the political will

87
00:05:16,099 --> 00:05:19,058
to turn it around really quickly,
so to be able to create

88
00:05:19,678 --> 00:05:22,908
a platform within
three months is fantastic.

89
00:05:23,358 --> 00:05:27,418
I think probably the critical thing
I've learned about that though is pace.

90
00:05:27,939 --> 00:05:32,275
I think whilst it's great they were able
to respond to the political demand,

91
00:05:32,665 --> 00:05:34,509
I think there are some challenges,

92

00:05:34,796 --> 00:05:35,467
and for me,

93
00:05:35,894 --> 00:05:38,681
I think some of the questions that
you were asking about some

94
00:05:38,884 --> 00:05:42,158
of the more marginalised communities
and areas of deprivation

95
00:05:42,544 --> 00:05:45,741
they weren't able to answer
because the technology

96
00:05:46,012 --> 00:05:48,044
didn't allow them to
scrutinise in that level.

97
00:06:00,720 --> 00:06:07,497
The workshops that were put forward
by the town hall for the 2016 round,

98
00:06:08,234 --> 00:06:13,396
so these are the supports
that we put out for people.

99
00:06:13,911 --> 00:06:18,730
So, those were actually put forward by
the administration, but with the result of

100
00:06:19,301 --> 00:06:22,384
talking to local groups
and so on, for example,

101
00:06:22,721 --> 00:06:25,947
investing in sporting facilities
was put forward by

102
00:06:26,354 --> 00:06:29,008
a voluntary organisation
working with young people

103

00:06:29,619 --> 00:06:31,701
who said that we have
no sporting facilities.

104
00:06:32,140 --> 00:06:33,445
So, it was a partnership.

105
00:06:33,876 --> 00:06:35,290
These themes

106
00:06:35,714 --> 00:06:38,266
were actually arrived
at not simply

107
00:06:38,581 --> 00:06:39,879
by the administration saying,

108
00:06:40,175 --> 00:06:41,790
this is what we want you to talk about.

109
00:06:42,404 --> 00:06:44,101
It was fabulous for me to see

110
00:06:44,369 --> 00:06:46,208
that they also have
local development officers

111
00:06:46,472 --> 00:06:49,887
that they have deployed to areas that
maybe have been less involved in the past

112
00:06:50,312 --> 00:06:52,594
and voices less heard.

113
00:06:53,120 --> 00:06:56,398
So, that's something that we are really
keen to develop across Fife.

114
00:06:56,928 --> 00:06:57,963
They have set up,

115
00:06:58,181 --> 00:06:59,949

they have invested
a lot of money in staff,

116
00:07:00,398 --> 00:07:02,462
it's not just been done on a shoestring,

117
00:07:02,811 --> 00:07:05,457
there's real investment in developing

118
00:07:06,028 --> 00:07:08,881
a workforce behind them and bringing
the workforce with them.

119
00:07:53,502 --> 00:07:56,524
In Glasgow City Council Community
Planning Partnership

120
00:07:56,664 --> 00:07:59,752
we don't have a steering committee
at a strategic level such as is Paris.

121
00:08:00,205 --> 00:08:02,936
What we do have is a small
working group at officer level

122
00:08:03,437 --> 00:08:05,515
and that involves the officers
who are involved in coordinating,

123
00:08:05,798 --> 00:08:07,311
and we come together fortnightly,

124
00:08:07,851 --> 00:08:08,606
but we are officers.

125
00:08:09,254 --> 00:08:11,466
At a local level,
we have steering committees

126
00:08:11,889 --> 00:08:13,392
that involve neighbourhood
community councils

127
00:08:13,932 --> 00:08:17,513
and involve officers and partner organisations,

128
00:08:17,924 --> 00:08:21,755
so there are small steering committees and
most, some of the wards, not all of them,

129
00:08:22,215 --> 00:08:23,926
some of the wards have
a steering committee

130
00:08:24,354 --> 00:08:26,075
that brings together
the community council.

131
00:08:31,383 --> 00:08:35,453
We don't often get that many opportunities
to go and really explore somewhere

132
00:08:35,994 --> 00:08:39,237
that has created something different

133
00:08:39,847 --> 00:08:42,969
and to have conversations about it

134
00:08:43,684 --> 00:08:45,586
and to see people structures,
and I suppose

135
00:08:46,686 --> 00:08:51,206
Paris was interesting in the fact
that the structure in Paris,

136
00:08:51,664 --> 00:08:53,642
albeit the fact that itâ€™s much larger,

137
00:08:54,744 --> 00:08:59,561
has got a lot of similarities to Glasgow
in terms of the social aspects of it, but

138
00:09:00,038 --> 00:09:03,030
also the kind of infrastructure of the

breakdown of areas and those

139

00:09:03,330 --> 00:09:05,478

kind of things, so it was quite interesting for me

140

00:09:05,822 --> 00:09:07,225

to see some of how that would work.

141

00:09:07,478 --> 00:09:09,421

I think one of the things that has struck me

142

00:09:09,741 --> 00:09:11,214

thatâ€™s different from the Scottish model is

143

00:09:11,913 --> 00:09:14,395

that the Scottish model isnâ€™t about

144

00:09:14,706 --> 00:09:18,905

the public deciding how services should deliver their budgets,

145

00:09:19,592 --> 00:09:23,897

it's about a different way of working of services

146

00:09:25,404 --> 00:09:28,133

working with and for communities.

147

00:09:28,472 --> 00:09:30,614

I would, in the Scottish model, I would expect

148

00:09:32,946 --> 00:09:35,934

citizens to be much more involved with implementation

149

00:09:36,356 --> 00:09:39,884

and perhaps even the delivery,

that it's not necessarily

150

00:09:40,167 --> 00:09:41,374

that it's automatically
it would be the council

151

00:09:41,752 --> 00:09:44,422

that would deliver the
local solution that's needed.

152

00:09:45,241 --> 00:09:47,822

Itâ€™s very well structured,
very well organised,

153

00:09:48,347 --> 00:09:51,045

I've certainly learnt
a lot from the trip

154

00:09:51,436 --> 00:09:53,661

and I think I will be taking a lot back

155

00:09:54,048 --> 00:09:58,364

in terms of taking it back and having
these discussions at a political level

156

00:09:59,073 --> 00:10:02,683

and within the kind or organisation
within the city council as well,

157

00:10:03,219 --> 00:10:06,257

about what can be achieved,
and just the lessons learned as well,

158

00:10:07,097 --> 00:10:08,937

and the lessons Paris learned,

159

00:10:13,497 --> 00:10:17,857

the challenges that they faced, and
the evolutions they've gone through.

160

00:10:18,137 --> 00:10:22,643

It was useful to have
Rosemary to translate,

161
00:10:22,929 --> 00:10:27,509
I think it had a good mix
across meetings

162
00:10:27,985 --> 00:10:30,598
where we've been able to,

163
00:10:31,962 --> 00:10:34,201
you know, weâ€™ve ones
that have been wholly in English,

164
00:10:34,674 --> 00:10:38,294
weâ€™ve had a steering group meeting
that was mainly in French,

165
00:10:38,686 --> 00:10:41,823
weâ€™ve had other
ones sort of in between.

166
00:10:42,721 --> 00:10:46,575
I did some translation of some
of the background documentation

167
00:10:47,026 --> 00:10:48,964
before we came so that we did...

168
00:10:50,042 --> 00:10:53,482
so that we were familiar with some
of the terminology and language used also.

169
00:10:54,718 --> 00:10:57,291
But, I think one of the key things
is that sometimes

170
00:10:58,521 --> 00:11:00,562
we need to make sure
that participatory budgeting

171
00:11:00,948 --> 00:11:02,851
doesnâ€™t become an end in itself,

172

00:11:03,754 --> 00:11:07,743
that we look for what is the
purpose of participatory budgeting.

173
00:11:08,258 --> 00:11:11,974
Is it about empowering individuals,
which is the ultimate?

174
00:11:12,404 --> 00:11:17,150
Is that the ultimate aim through
greater democratic participation?

175
00:11:17,438 --> 00:11:20,087
Or is it about changing the way
how we deliver our services?

176
00:11:25,014 --> 00:11:28,147
So, it's good to know and be able to measure
yourself against another local authority,

177
00:11:28,963 --> 00:11:31,524
so we could see that Fife
is just about to mainstream.

178
00:11:32,043 --> 00:11:34,761
They've been doing their small grant
stuff only on a smaller scale

179
00:11:35,385 --> 00:11:39,230
but they're obviously at
a very similar place to us

180
00:11:39,538 --> 00:11:40,548
which was really,
really, comforting,

181
00:11:40,904 --> 00:11:42,734
because sometimes you need
a measure and a barometer

182
00:11:43,161 --> 00:11:46,122
to know where you're at
and to compare yourself against,

183

00:11:46,584 --> 00:11:48,848

because sometimes you're wondering
if you're going in the right direction.

184

00:11:49,432 --> 00:11:51,749

I'm hoping sincerely that
it doesn't just stop here,

185

00:11:52,326 --> 00:11:55,860

that Glasgow, Fife, you know,
that we have a stronger connection,

186

00:11:56,110 --> 00:11:57,812

because we have got
people willing to do PB.

187

00:11:58,136 --> 00:11:59,624

So, to me that's the
difference it's made,

188

00:11:59,951 --> 00:12:01,689

is its brought people together
with a common purpose

189

00:12:02,012 --> 00:12:04,550

who are keen, enthusiastic and have
a belief that this could work.

190

00:12:05,048 --> 00:12:08,838

I think they need to write
a blog on their experiences

191

00:12:08,958 --> 00:12:11,318

and reflect in that initial way.

192

00:12:11,488 --> 00:12:15,342

I think they need to
talk to each other

193

00:12:15,542 --> 00:12:17,842

and also talk to Paris.

194

00:12:17,982 --> 00:12:22,878
What Works Scotland here has
worked as a facilitator,

195
00:12:23,199 --> 00:12:25,814
if you like, we've lit the
blue touch paper to allow

196
00:12:26,181 --> 00:12:29,654
Glasgow and Fife
to take PB forward,

197
00:12:30,082 --> 00:12:32,277
learning from
the Paris model,

198
00:12:32,671 --> 00:12:34,437
not replicating it,
but learning from it,

199
00:12:34,888 --> 00:12:37,177
and I think they need to do
that together

200
00:12:37,604 --> 00:12:39,367
and they've got
a great opportunity here

201
00:12:39,943 --> 00:12:42,955
to build and develop
from the contacts that

202
00:12:43,326 --> 00:12:45,075
they have made in Paris
over the last few days.